

1

Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta

The Greater Discourse on the Lion-roar | M 12

Theme: An overview of the Buddha's special qualities

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2015

1 Sutta summary and highlights

1.1 OVERVIEW

1.1.1 Sunakkhatta's limited capability. The **Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta** (M 12), “the greater discourse on the lion-roar,” records the Buddha's response to criticisms made by Sunakkhatta, a former monk, who charges that the Buddha is not endowed with supernormal powers and that “the Dharma he teaches is only for the purpose of the complete end of suffering” [§2.3].

In the Buddha's time, having supernormal powers was often seen by the masses as a sign of religious attainment or power. However, since no one amongst the masses had any such power, they would be unable to discern whether the wonders displayed were in fact miracles. Most sectarians tried to take advantage of this common ignorance to assert their influence, and so attract support and patronage.

The Buddha explains that Sunakkhatta, on account of his limited capability, is unable to see the Buddha's powers, intrepidity and attainments. Apparently, Sunakkhatta expects the Buddha to conduct himself in some extraordinarily religious way, teach him about the origin of things, and perform miracles.

1.1.2 The Buddha's attainments. The Buddha then describes his powers, intrepidity and attainments. He also describes the various self-mortifying practices which he has tried as a Bodhisattva in his past lives [§§44-61]. Some of these practices are also those he has practised during his ascetic years, but finding them unhelpful, even un conducive, to spiritual awakening, he gives them up for the middle way of meditation.

Towards the end of the Sutta, the Buddha warns that, since his knowledge and qualities have been attained through his self-awakening, it would be wrong to accuse him of lacking them, as Sunakkhatta has done [1.1.3]. In other words, Sunakkhatta is merely making empty accusations, out of his frustration that the Buddha refuses to demonstrate his superhuman powers to him, or to teach him regarding what is unrelated to his spiritual training.

1.1.3 A polemical work? In making such false accusations [1.1.2], Sunakkhatta is creating bad karma with hellish results. Although the Buddha often declares that having wrong views entails bad karma bringing about rebirth as an animal or in the hell-states [eg §18.2; 3.3.2], the **Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta** is perhaps the only sutta that actually states this warning in specific terms, that is, in the “hell refrains” [§§21, 28, 31, 34, 43].

The Sutta merely warns that “if he [the accuser] does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not give up such a view, he will, *as it were*, be carried away and cast into hell” [§21 etc].¹ Moreover, the Buddha explains that Sunakkhatta has made such false accusations on account of his being “a hollow man who is angry,” and that “these are words of one who is angry” [§4].

This is apparently the closest we have of a sutta as a polemical work. The Buddha's warning here is, of course, not as drastic as the long-winded, vituperative curses in the Mahāyāna works, such as chapter 3 of the Lotus Sutra.² In fact, the Buddha states that Sunakkhatta is actually and unwittingly praising the Buddha when he declares that “The Dharma that he teaches is only for the purpose of the complete destruction of suffering” [§4].

¹ Cf J G Jones, *Tales and Teachings of the Buddha*, 1979:154 f.

² Like a number of other Mahāyāna Suttas, the Lotus Sutra declares that we should be devoted to the Sutra itself, such as the “5 practices” of “receiving and keeping, reading, reciting, teaching and copying” of even a single verse. Such a devotee will receive all kinds of blessings (and not fall into hell) (ch 3, 10, 11, 13-15, 17, 19-21, 23, 27, 28). Yet, in every published copy of the work, we see a copyright notice! In ch 3, it also says that we should only receive and keep a Mahāyāna Sutra, “even without accepting a single verse of any other sutra,” and so on. These are clear examples of polemics, which are clearly against the historical Buddha's teachings.

1.2 SUTTA SUMMARY

[§1] While the Buddha is residing in a forest west of Vesālī, [§2] Sunakkhatta, who has left the order, denounces the Buddha to be one lacking any superhuman states or qualities of a liberated saint, that he is merely teaching something he has thought out, and that his teaching is only for the complete ending of suffering.

[§3] Sāriputta hears about Sunakkhatta's accusations and reports them to the Buddha, [§4] who responds by saying that Sunakkhatta is acting out of malice, and [§5] does not know the Buddha's true state. The Buddha then speaks of [§6] his psychic powers, [§7] clairaudience, and [§8] mind-reading. Further, the Buddha expounds on this list of powers and knowledge that he has:

[§§9-21]	the 10 tathagata powers	<i>tathāgata dasa,bala</i>
[§§22-28]	his 4 kinds of intrepidity	<i>catu vesārajja</i>
[§§29-30]	his knowledge of the 8 assemblies	<i>aṭṭha parisa</i>
[§§32-34]	the 4 kinds of birth	<i>catu yoni</i>
[§§35-43]	the 5 destinies and nirvana	<i>pañca gati</i>
[§§44-63]	the Bodhisattva's austerities	<i>atta,kilamath'ānuyoga</i>

on account of which he “roars his lion's roar in the assemblies.”³

[§64] The Sutta concludes with an account of how Nāga,samāla, the Buddha's personal attendant at that time, who is standing behind the Buddha, fanning him, exults that he is enthralled with the teaching, so that he horripilates (*lomāni haṭṭhāni*). On that account, the Buddha tells him that the Sutta should be remembered as “the hair-raising exposition” (*loma.hamsana,pariyāya*) [1.3.2.2].

1.3 SUTTA HIGHLIGHTS

1.3.1 A late work

1.3.1.1 There are a number of reasons that the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta is a late canonical work. Firstly, it is a **very long text**, especially too lengthy for a sutta in the Majjhima Nikāya. Also on its account of an array of the Buddha's powers, intrepidity, and various self-mortifying practices as Bodhisattva, it fits better in the Dīgha Nikāya. As such, it comes as no surprise that the Mūla,sarvāsti.vāda recorded their version of the sutta in their Dīrgha Āgama collection.⁴ [1.3.1.2]

The Sutta's length and rich variety are reflected in its detailed lists of various powers and qualities of the Buddha, namely, the tathagata's 10 powers, his fourfold intrepidity, and detailed accounts of various self-mortifying practices, that is, “the Bodhisattva's fourfold austerities” [§§44-48] and related austerities [§§49-61]. These reports of his notorious practice of self-mortification take up the closing (almost half of) the Sutta itself. [1.3.5.1]

1.3.1.2 Clearly, this section of **the Bodhisattva's self-mortification** alludes to the various ascetic practices he has done in toto, as it were, that is, those of his past lives [§§44-61], some of which he does in his pre-awakening ascetic days. This Jātaka-like listing is a further hint at the lateness of the Sutta. The early suttas, as a rule, refer only to his experiences in his last life, including those as a bodhisattva.

All this is not actually Dharma teaching, but a recounting of his struggle as a Bodhisattva, almost as a presentation of his abilities and charisma to legitimize himself, or at least to refute Sunakkhatta's unfounded allegations, especially after being such a close follower. Like most, if not all, of the Dīgha suttas, this lengthy account fits better in that Nikāya, which comprises impressive accounts of the Buddha and his teaching with the clear purpose of impressing a newcomer or converting the doubtful—that is, as a sort of spiritual prospectus.⁵ [1.4.1]

1.3.1.3 Another important clue to the lateness of the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta is that it has given itself a **title**, that is, at its close [§64.2]. At the close of the Sutta, the Buddha's personal attendant, Nāga,samāla, who is standing behind the Buddha, fanning him, exults that he is enthralled with the teaching, so that he

³ §§17-19 + 32-43 here (found in SD 2.24) should be studied in connection with **Pātāla Sutta** (S 36.4), and (**Pañca) Gati Sutta** (A 9.68), both of which deal with types and levels of existence.

⁴ For a survey of the Mūla,sarvāsti.vāda Dīrgha Āgama, see Hartman 2000:367.

⁵ See SD 30.8 (4.1.2).

has horripilation (*loma,haṃsa*). On that account, the Buddha tells him that the Sutta should be remembered as “the hair-raising exposition” (*loma.haṃsana,pariyāya*) [§64].

This is apparently also the title by which its Sanskrit version is known, that is, the *Roma,haṃsarṇa Sūtra*.⁶ The individual Chinese translation (T757) similarly has the title, 佛說身毛喜豎經 *Fó shuō shēn máo xǐ shù jīng*, “the discourse that raises bodily hairs out of joy.”⁷ Titles of suttas not only vary between Pali and Chinese versions, but also between different sutta versions in different Pali Nikāyas.⁸

1.3.1.4 A fourth characteristic of the Sutta is that it is a **devotional text**, one that glorifies the Buddha as a **fully accomplished teacher** who is without peer, both in spiritual power and knowledge. The Sutta, in other words, is more *Buddha-centred* rather than Dharma-centred. It highlights, for example, the 10 tathagata-powers of the Tathagata [§§9-20], which legitimize the Buddha as *the* supreme world teacher who is fully awakened, having a wide range of powers of understanding the mind of beings and teaching the Dharma to them.

1.3.1.5 A third clue to the lateness of the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta is the Buddha’s mention of **his age** being “my years have turned 80” [§62.2]. The Sutta Commentary confirms that this Sutta was given by the Buddha during his parinirvana year (MA 2:51). Although such suttas have some historical highlights in the Buddha’s life, much of the material is clearly the compilation of sangha fathers or early reciters who have put together such texts for the training of Buddhist followers and for legitimizing and promoting the Buddha Dharma as the most authentic teaching for the world.

It is very interesting to note that near the very end of the Sutta, the Buddha expressly, almost strenuously, dispels any misapprehensions that his age is affecting his mind and powers [§§62-63]. Perhaps, Sunakkhatta, like Devadatta, may have remarked that the Buddha is getting “too old” for his job, as it were. While Devadatta thinks that a new leader would revitalize the sangha, Sunakkhatta simply (but wrongly) surmises that the Buddha has become too feeble-minded to be an effective teacher.

1.3.1.6 Looking at all these points as a whole, it is not surprising that the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta gives a heavy air of **apologetics**, a calculated defence to stave off an unwarranted attack or challenge to the Buddha from an ex-monk. Apologetical works—the best known of which is **the Milinda,pañha**—are often helpful when a system or religion matures and has grown considerably in size and influence, so that they attract competition and criticism (mainly out of “professional” jealousy) from other systems or religions. The point is that this approach further reflects the lateness of the Sutta, too.

1.3.2 Related Pali texts. **The Cariyā Piṭaka** (C), the 15th and last book of the Khuddaka Nikāya (Kh), comprises 35 Jātaka-like stories in 3 chapters (*vagga*), illustrating the 10 perfections (*pāramī*). Of these 35 accounts, 32 can be directly related to the Jātaka collection. A number of the Cariyas or stories have suttas bearing the same names. They are connected in different ways.

The Mahā Govinda Cariya (C 1.5), which illustrates the Bodhisattva’s virtue of giving (*dāna*), for example, seems to have been based on **the Mahā Govinda Sutta** (D 19),⁹ but has no correspondence in the Jātaka.

The Mahā Loma,haṃsa Cariya (C 3.15) illustrates the Bodhisattva’s virtue of equanimity (*upekkhā*). As an ascetic, he lives in a charnel ground, sleeping amongst the skeletons. Some villagers deride him; others offer him scents, garlands and food. He shows them both no anger, only compassion.

⁶ The name *ro(mahaṃsarṇa),sūtra* is reconstructed from a colophon (*uddāna*) preserved in a Hoernle fragment in Hartmann 1991:237, who notes the reference, *romaharṣaṇīya sūtra*, to our text in *Karmavibhaṅgopadeśa (S Lévi 1932: 158,11).

⁷ T757 @ T17.591c11, from 經集部 *Jīng jí bù* (Collections of suttas).

⁸ **Bahu,vedanīya S** (M 59/1:396), SD 30.4, recurs in Saṃyutta as **Pañcak’aṅga S** (S 36.19/4:224), SD 30.1; **Cā-tumā S** (M 67,14-20/1:456), SD 34.7, recurs in the Aṅguttara as **Ūmi,bhaya S** (A 4.122/2:123), SD 47.9. On the issue of variant titles of same suttas in different traditional MSS, see Analayo, *A Comparative Study of the Majjhima-nikāya*, Taipei, 2011:106 n42.

⁹ D 19/2:220-251 @ SD 70.6. Cf Mvst 3:197 ff.

The Mahā Loma,haṃsa Cariya, however, does not seem to be identical to **the Loma,haṃsa Jātaka** (J 94) [1.3.3]. However, it is connected to **the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta** (M 12), as attested by the remarks on his living in the charnel ground [§51], and that the Sutta is also titled Loma,haṃsana Pariyāya [§64].¹⁰

2 The Mahā Loma,haṃsa Cariya (C 3.15)

2.1 THE BODHISATTVĀ’S CONDUCT. This is a short text, the last “conduct” (*cariya*) of the Cariyā, -piṭaka, which is a versification of §51 of the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta (M 1:79), and which closes with the words, “Such, Sāriputta, was my abiding in equanimity” (*idaṃ su me sāriputta upekkhā, vihārasmiṃ hoti*).

SD 49.2(2.1)

Mahā Loma,haṃsa Cariya

The Great Hair-raising Conduct | C 3.15/35 f
Theme: The Bodhisattva as a self-mortifying ascetic

- | | | |
|---|---|-------|
| 1 | I made my bed in the charnel-ground, leaning against a skeleton (as my pillow).
Village boys came and taunted me in various ways. ¹¹ | C 359 |
| 2 | Others bring various and numerous offerings of scents, and garlands, and food,
happily, with hearts moved by emotion, they make their offerings. | C 360 |
| 3 | Those who brought me pain, and those who gave me comfort [joy]—
I show them all the same compassion, free from anger. | C 361 |
| 4 | Having become balanced towards joy and pain, towards fame and ill-fame [obscurity], ¹²
I was the same all the time— this was my perfection of equanimity. | C 362 |

2.2 THE LOMA,HAṂSA JĀTAKA (J 94) is a short birth-story whose introduction is mostly quoted from **the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta** [§50], but with more details than the Sutta Commentary (MA 2:48). It says that Sunakkhatta, after converting to the teachings of the ascetic Kora-k,khattiya, reverts to the lay life. After Kora-k,khattiya’s death, Sunakkhatta goes about Vesālī denouncing the Buddha.

Sāriputta, hearing of Sunakkhatta’s denunciations, reports them to the Buddha, who then expounds the teachings of the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta. After teaching the Sutta, the Buddha goes on to relate the Mahā Loma,haṃsa Jātaka, with the following introduction, followed by a full translation of the Jātaka itself:

SD 49.2(2.2)

Loma,haṃsa Jātaka

The Hair-raising Birth Story | J 94/1:389-391
Theme: The Bodhisattva experiments with self-mortifying asceticism

Introduction

1 “Ninety-one world-cycles ago, I lived the 4-factored holy life,¹³ by way of investigating false asceticism (*micchā tapa*) to discover whether there is any essence [truth] therein. An ascetic was I, the supreme ascetics; rough-living was I, supreme in rough living; (morally) scrupulous was I, supremely

¹⁰ See C:H viii f. On C, see K R Norman, *Pali Literature*, 1983:95 n436.

¹¹ *Susāne seyyam kappemi | chav’atthim upadhāya’ham || go,maṇḍalā upagantvā | rūpaṃ dassenti nappakaṃ*. This verse is quoted at J 1:47, BA 61, ApA 51 to illustrate the perfection of equanimity, and refer to C 359 for the full meaning. See C:H viii & I B Horner, *Ten Jātaka Stories*, London, 1057: xxi.

¹² “Fame and ill-fame” (*yasesu ayasesu ca*), which Comy glosses as “glory and insults” (*kittisu nindāsu*, CA 270).

¹³ For details, see §44-48 of M 12 here.

scrupulous; a solitary dweller was I, a supreme solitary dweller.”¹⁴ When he (the Blessed One) had said this, he was asked by the elder (Sāriputta) about the past.

The story of the past

2 ¹⁵Once upon a time, 91 world-cycles ago, the Bodhisattva went forth as an ajivika [naked ascetic] to investigate an outside [false] asceticism (*bāhiraka, tapa*). He went about naked (*acelaka*) and covered in dirt (*rajo, jallika*), living in solitude [living apart], a lone dweller.¹⁶ Seeing humans, he fled like a deer.

3 The food was the “great filth”: he fed on a calf’s cowdung, and so on.¹⁷

4 For the sake of diligence, he took up his abode in a dreadful thicket in the jungle.

5 There, in the snows of winter, he spent the night in the open, away from the sheltering thicket, returning at dawn to the thicket again. By night, he was wet with the driving snows; by day, he was drenched by the droplets from the thicket branches. Thus, day and night, he suffered extreme cold.

6 In summer, he lived by day in the open, and by night in the forest. Just as by day he was feverishly scorched by the blazing sun, even so, by night, feverishly fanned by the cold winds, so that sweat streamed from his body.¹⁸

7 Then, this verse, unheard of before, occurred to him:

94 Now chilled, now scorched, alone in a fearful forest,
 naked, without a fire to sit by, the (silent) sage is intent upon his quest. **[391]**¹⁹[§50.3]

8 Having thus lived the holy life comprising 4 factors, when the time of dying arrived, he saw a vision of hell (*niraya, nimitta*). Realizing that, “The undertaking of this austerity is worthless!” at that very moment, he cut off his delusion, attained right view, and arose in the deva world.”²⁰

9 Having given this Dharma teaching, the Teacher identified the birth-story, saying, “I was, at that time, the naked ascetic.”²¹

— — —

3 THE MAHĀ SĪHA.NĀDA SUTTA IN COMPARATIVE LIGHT

3.1 THE SUTTA LENGTH

3.1.1 Unlike the other suttas of the Majjhima Nikāya, which are mostly of moderate or “middle” length, the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta is a relatively long text, certainly too long a text for this Nikāya. Due to its length and rich variety of topics, especially those on the Buddha’s powers and austerities [1.3.2.1], it would have been better located in the Dīgha Nikāya, the collection of “long discourses.”

3.1.2 On account of the Sutta’s inordinate length, unsurprisingly, the (Mula-)Sarvastivadins located their version in their Dīrgha Āgama collection.²² This Dīrgha Āgama version apparently has **the title**

¹⁴ *Tapassī sudam homi param, atapassī, lūkho sudam homi parama, lūkho, jegucchī sudam homi parama, jegucchī, pavivitto sudam homi parama, pavivitto’ti.*

¹⁵ On §§2-7 here, cf M 12,48-50 below.

¹⁶ “Living in solitude, ...,” *pavivitto ahoṣi eka, vihārī*. On *pavivitta*, see (6 §48). On *eka, vihārī*, see SD 44.6 (3.1).

¹⁷ *Mahā, vikati, bhojano ahoṣi, vacchaka, go. may’ādāni paribhuñji*. On “the ‘great filth’,” see M 12,49 n above. Cf “He lived on filth, too, devoted to taking filth as food” (*vekaṭiko pi hoti vikaṭa, bhojanānuyogaṃ anuyutto*, D 8/1:-167,10), SD 73.12. For ~*vikati*, M 1:79,19 reads ~*vikaṭa*. Elaborated in **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,49) below.

¹⁸ *So yathā divā abbhokāse ātapena pariḷāha-p,atto, tath’eva rattim nivāte vanasaṇḍe pariḷāhaṃ pāpuṇāti, sarīrā sēda, dhārā muccanti.*

¹⁹ Word *comy*, which follows, has been omitted here.

²⁰ *Idam vata, samādānam niratthakan’ti ñatvā taṇ, khaṇaṇ, ñeva taṃ laddhim bhinditvā sammā, diṭṭhim gahetvā deva, loke nibbatti.*

²¹ On **the story of the past**, cf C 102.

²² See the survey of (Mula-)Sarvastivadin Dīrgha Āgama in Hartmann 2000:367.

“Hair-raising” Discourse,²³ similar to the individual Chinese translation, which has the title, the “Discourse that raises the bodily hairs out of joy.”²⁴ [1.3.1.1]

3.2 THE SUTTA TITLE

3.2.1 This title [1.4.1.2] is also mentioned in the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta itself at the conclusion, when the Buddha, upon Nāga,samala’s remark that he horripilates in joy on hearing it, so that the Buddha decides to call it the “Hair-raising Dharma Exposition”²⁵ [§64]. The title “Hair-raising” further recurs in the **Loma,haṁsa Jātaka** (J 94), which parallels the beginning part of the Sutta, and in references found in several later Pali works.²⁶

3.2.2 According to Analayo, this variation in the Sutta’s titles suggests that the Pali version of our Sutta was known for quite some time under the name of Loma,haṁsana Pariyāya, instead of Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta²⁷ (2011:105 f). In fact, title variations often occur not only between Pali and Chinese versions of a sutta,²⁸ but also between Pali versions of the same sutta found in different Nikāyas, or between different Pali editions of the same sutta.²⁹ According to Skilling, this suggests that a sutta title was relatively open to change at least during the early stages of transmission.³⁰

3.3 NARRATIVE INTRODUCTION [§§1-5]

3.3.1 Sunakkhatta publicly disparages the Buddha [§2]. The Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta and its Chinese version begin with Sāriputta informing the Buddha that Sunakkhatta, a former monk who has left the sangha, is publicly disparaging the Buddha and the Dharma. The two versions differ in that while the Pali account presents Sunakkhatta as declaring that the Buddha’s teaching leads to the destruction of suffering,

²³ *Ro(maharṣaṇa),sūtra*, reconstructed title (from an *uddāna* preserved in a Hoernle fragment) in Hartmann 1991:237, who notes that the same title recurs in a ref to our Sutta in *Karmavibhaṅgopadeśa in Levi 1932a:158,11: *romaharṣaṇīya sūtra*.

²⁴ T757 @ T17.591c11: 佛說身毛喜豎經 *Fó Shuō shēn máo xǐ shù jīng*.

²⁵ M 12,64/1: 83,25: *loma,haṁsana,pariyāya*. The title *loma,haṁsa* occurs also in the summary verse (*uddāna*) of M:Be 1:172,6 and M:Se 1:247,17, even though these eds use *mahāsīhanāda* as the title at M:Be 1:97,14 and M:Se 1:137,1.

²⁶ J 94/1:389,14. In **Milinda,pañha**, Nāgasena quotes part of Mahā Sīhanāda S, which he refers to as Loma,haṁsana Pariyāya (Miln 392,2). Another ref to Loma,haṁsana Pariyāya is in Pañca-p,pakaraṇa,aṭṭhakathā (Be) 104. Several Pali works refer to the Sutta as Loma,haṁsa(na) Sutta: DA 1:179,3, ItA 1:109,1, AAPT:Be 2:256, SAPT:Be 1:334, Abhdhp:Be 504, and SilkhvANT:Be 2:74. C 35,23 titles a set of stanzas (359-362) on the Bodhisattva’s ascetic practices as Mahā Loma,haṁsa Cariyā, the “great hair-raising conduct”; cf also Charpentier 1910a:400-403.

²⁷ Although according to the subcom, SAPT:Be 2:40, the title Mahā Sīhanāda was given to this sutta at the time of the so-called 1st council by the council elders (*saṅgīti,kāra mahā,thera*), the substantial number of refs to this sutta under the title Loma,haṁsana in later Pali literature shows that this alternate title was well known and in use for a considerable time after that.

²⁸ Two examples from the Majjhima Nikāya are **Bahu,vedanīya S** (M 59/1:396), SD 30.4, which recurs as **Pañca-k’aṅga S** (S 36.19/4:223), SD 30.1, and **Cātumā S** (M 67/1:456), SD 34.7, which (without its first part) recurs as **Umi,bhaya S** (A 4.122/2:123), SD 47.9.

²⁹ Title variations between different Pali eds of the same Majjhima Nikāya suttas are **Vatthūpama S** (M 7), SD 28.12, where Be has the title Vattha S; **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26), SD 1.11, where Be and Se have **Pāsa,rāsi S**; **Sekha S** (M 53), SD 21.14, where Se has **Sekha Paṭipadā S**; **Upali S** (M 56), where Se has the title **Upali,vāda S**; **Amba,laṭṭhika Rāul’ovāda S** (M 61), SD 3.10, where Se has **Cūla Rāhul’ovāda S**; **Cūla Mālunḍika S** (M 63), SD 5.8, where Se has **Cūla Mālunḍika’ovāda S**; **Tevijja Vaccha,gotta S** (M 71), SD 53.3, where Be has **Tevijja Vaccha S**, and Se **Cūla Vaccha,gotta S**; **Aggi Vaccha,gotta S** (M 72), SD 6.15, where Be has **Aggi,vaccha S**; **Mahā Vaccha,gotta S** (M 73), where Be has **Mahā Vaccha S**; **Bakkula S** (M 124), where Se has **Bakkula-t,ther’acchariya-b,bhuta S**; and **Mahā Saḷ-āyatanika S** (M 149), SD 41.9, where Se has **Saḷ-āyatana Vibhaṅga S**. See Analayo 2010:53. On title variations in *Jataka stories*, see Feer 1875:367-377, Jones 1979:12, Lüders 1941:136 f, and von Hinüber 1998:7-16.

³⁰ Skilling: “It is evident that the collections of different schools and different regions used different titles and that within any single collection there could be alternate titles (for example *Majjhimanikāya* Sutta 26 is called *Pāsārāsi* in some manuscript traditions, and *Ariyapariyesana* in others). There was no standardization of titles, which might be taken as meaning that the titles were devised later, but for the fact that many titles are shared by Mahāvihāra and Sarvāstivādin collections.” (2009:64)

in the Chinese version Sunakkhatta declares that the Buddha's teaching is incapable of leading us to the end of suffering.³¹

According to Analayo, in terms of Sunakkhatta's disparaging the Buddha, the Chinese version seems more to the point.³² Freedom from suffering appears to have been a goal aspired to among other ancient Indian recluses and ascetics in general,³³ so that to disparage a teacher it would make sense to proclaim that he was unable to lead his disciples to this goal. (2011:107)

3.3.2 Rebirth in hell. In reply to this challenge, according to both versions, the Buddha gives a detailed description of his qualities and powers. Anyone who persists in slandering the Buddha despite his spirituality as described, on account of such a wrong view and malice, will end up in a **hellish state**. The "hell refrain" appears a total of 10 times, following the list of the unwholesome actions, slanderous remarks and wrong views. Interestingly, this is a general remark about the result of habitual bad karma, not just slandering against the Buddha.³⁴

Note here that it is not the Buddha who "sends" such a person to hell or the worst suffering state, but the perpetrator's own bad karma of slandering an innocent and pure person, the Buddha. Such a statement may appear shocking to a "modern" or scientific-minded person, but we are not talking about a place where beings are tortured (although this is traditionally the imagery used in religious literature). Hell, in other words, is not a place, but a state of mind: we are tortured and suffer on account of our own thoughts and habitual tendencies. The hell imageries only artistically depict the kind of sufferings that we actually feel in our own minds.³⁵

3.4 THE 3 POWERS [§§6-8]

3.4.1 The Sutta's defence of the Buddha begins with his listing of the "3 powers," that is,

- | | | |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|------|
| (1) the manifold psychic powers, | <i>iddhi, vidhā</i> | [§6] |
| (2) the divine ear, and | <i>dibba, sota</i> | [§7] |
| (3) mind-reading. | <i>para.citta, vijānana</i> | [§8] |

Interestingly, these are only the first 3 of the "6 superknowledges" (*cha-l-abhiññā*), which are mundane powers (they do not bring awakening). The more common listing would be the "3 knowledges" (*te, vijjā*) of an arhat, that is,

- | | |
|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| (4) recollection of past lives, | <i>pubbe, nivāsānussati, ñāṇa</i> |
| (5) the divine eye, ³⁶ and | <i>dibba, cakkhu</i> |
| (6) the destruction of the influxes. | <i>āsava-k, khaya, ñāṇa</i> |

³¹ In the Chin version, T757 @ T17.591c22, the later part of his declaration is: "How could [this teaching lead to] release, to the destruction and making an end of suffering," 豈能出要盡苦邊際 *Qǐ néng chū yào jìn kǔ biān jì?*

³² In §42 (M 1:69,1), the Buddha humorously points out that this statemnt is actually praise rather than slander. Comy explains that Sunakkhatta, in his accusation, admits that the Buddha's teaching leads to the destruction of suffering because he is afraid that, if he were to proclaim the opposite, he would provoke contradiction by those in Vesālī who have attained different levels of awakening through the Buddha's teaching (MA 2:23,7). **Analayo** thinks that this gloss is not particularly convincing, since the same inhabitants of Vesālī would quite probably feel similarly inclined to contradict Sunakkhatta's proclamation that the Buddha has not reached any extraordinary knowledge or vision, etc. What this gloss does indicate, however, is that as a disparaging remark, this statement does not sit well with the commentators, inducing them to attempt an explanation. (2011:107)

³³ **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2) reports Makkhali Gosala as teaching that fools and wise alike will reach the end of suffering through a succession of rebirths, *bāle ca paṇḍite ca sandhāvitvā saṃsaritvā dukhass'antaṃ karissanti* (D 1:54,20). According to **Cūḷa Dukkha-k,khandha S** (M 14), Nigaṇṭha Nāta,putta teaches that the end to suffering can only be reached through asceticism, *tapasā ... sabbaṃ dukkhaṃ nijjīṇaṃ bhavissati* (M 1:93.6). Nāta,pitta's view is confirmed, eg, in the **Thānaṅga 1.45** (Jambūvijaya 1985:9,2, where one of Mahāvīra's followers is said, amongst other things, to have eradicated all suffering. Hamilton remarks that "in the religious milieu in which he lived ... the Buddha was not alone in such a quest." (1997:279)

³⁴ §§18.2+5, 21.1+2, 28.1+2, 31.1+2, 34.1+2.

³⁵ See **Pāṭaliya S** (S 42.13), SD 2.25; SD 2.23 (3); SD 65.1.

³⁶ Also called the knowledge of death and rebirth (*cut'upapāta ñāṇa*) or the knowledge of how beings fare according to their karma (*yathā,kammūpaga ñāṇa*).

While (1) to (5) are all mundane knowledges and powers—called the “5 superknowledges (*pañcā-bhīṇṇa*),” only (6) is supramundane, which is the quality of an arhat.³⁷ In fact, these last three are an ancient set, well known as the “3 knowledges” of an arhat.³⁸

3.4.2 It is curious that the last 3 superknowledges, which are the defining knowledge of an arhat, are not listed here. Instead, only the first 3 mundane knowledges are listed. It is possible that here the Sutta’s purpose is to show that the Buddha is able to read Sunakkhatta’s mind and understand his personal disposition, as someone who has given up the teaching.

3.4.3 This list of 3 powers is not found in the Chinese version of the Sutta. Instead, the individual Chinese translation lists the Buddha’s ability to live in seclusion, and to develop the 4 dhyanas, the 4 attainments, and the attainment of cessation. The last three form an ancient set known as the “9 progressive abodes” (*nava anupubba, vihāra*), and are found only in the Buddha and the arhats.³⁹ It is possible here that the Chinese translation comes from an older source text, which fits the Sutta context better.

3.5 THE TATHAGATA’S 10 POWERS [§§9-21]

3.5.1 Both the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta and its Chinese version then turn to the 10 tathagata powers, which they describe in similar terms, differing only in the sequence of their presentation.⁴⁰ The Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta explains that these 10 powers are the grounds for the Buddha to roar his lion-roar in assemblies and set rolling the divine wheel (that is, teach the Dharma) [§9].⁴¹

3.5.2 The Chinese version makes a similar statement, but only in regard to the Buddha’s 4 intrepidities, which both discourses describe next.⁴²

3.6 THE 4 INTREPIDITIES [§§22-28]

3.6.1 As already noted, the Chinese version says that the Buddha roars his lion-roar in assemblies and sets rolling the divine wheel, on account of his 4 intrepidities [3.5.1].

3.6.2 A difference in regard to the first of the 4 intrepidities is that while the Pali version indicates that there is nothing left in regard to which the Buddha still has to awake, according to the Sutta, no one can rightly challenge the Buddha, who is fully awakened, that he is not so [§23]. This highlights the fact that his awakening is full and complete. The Chinese version, however, goes on to attribute omniscience to the Buddha.⁴³

3.6.3 Regarding the third of the Buddha’s 4 intrepidities in the Pali version, which is based on his insight into which states should be reckoned as “obstructions” (*antarāyikā dhammā*) [§25],⁴⁴ the Chinese version says that these obstructive states are actually desire and lust.⁴⁵ This suggestion fits well **with the Alagaddûpama Sutta** (M 22), where the same term recurs in a false statement by the monk, Ariṭṭha, that what the Buddha considers as “obstructions” are not really obstructive states, a statement that is thus in direct contradiction to this intrepidity of the Buddha.⁴⁶

³⁷ On the 6 powers, see SD 27.5a (5).

³⁸ See **Te, vijja S** (D 13) + SD 1.8 (2.2.2).

³⁹ On the 9 progressive abodes, see **Tevijja S** (D 13) @ SD 1.8 (2.2) (3) n & **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,34.2-42/-1:174 f), SD 1.11.

⁴⁰ See Analayo 2011:109 (Table 2.4).

⁴¹ For further discussion on the Buddha’s 10 powers, see Analayo 2011:110-113.

⁴² T757 @ T17.593b18.

⁴³ According to T757 @ T17.593b20, the Buddha “knows everything,” 一切智 *yī qiè zhì*, and there is “nothing he does not know,” 無所不知 *wú suǒ bù zhī* (一切智 *yī qiè zhì* is a standard tr of *sarvajña*, Skt “omniscience”; see eg Hirakawa, *Buddhist Chinese-Sanskrit Dictionary*, 1997:9, Karashima, *A Glossary of Kumārajīva’s Translation of the Lotus Sutra*, 2001:323, or Soothill, *A Dictionary of Chinese Buddhist Terms*, 1937:2). The Sutta come also attributes omniscience to the Buddha (MA 2:25,18). On the attribution of omniscience to the Buddha, see SD 7.1 (4.5); **Kaṇṇaka-t, thala S** (M 90), SD 10.8 (2); **Sandaka S** (M 76,21+52), SD 35.7; SD 36.2 (5.1.1.2). See also Analayo 2011:416.

⁴⁴ On *antarāyikā dhammā*, see V:H 3:21 n5.

⁴⁵ T757 @ T17.593c2 records the Buddha as saying: “Lust and desire, I say, are an obstruction to the path of the Dharma,” 我說貪欲是障道法 *wǒ shuō tān yù shì zhàng dào fǎ*.

⁴⁶ M 22,3.5/1:130,10 @ SD 3.13.

The Alagaddûpama Sutta recounts how other monks attempt to dissuade Aroṭṭha from his false view by bringing forth various similes on the danger of indulging in sensual desires. For them to immediately address the topic of sensual desires indicates that “obstructions” represent indulgence in sensuality and whatever hinders us from spiritual cultivation and awakening.

3.7 THE 8 ASSEMBLIES [§§29-31]

3.7.1 According to the Pali version, the Buddha is able to approach any of the 8 assemblies (kshatriyas, brahmins, houselords, recluses, the 4 great divine kings, the gods of the 33, Māra and Brahma) without fear due to his having the 4 intrepidities [§29].

The Chinese version, however, does not relate the Buddha’s approaching the 8 assemblies to any of his 4 intrepidities. Instead, it says that the Buddha would teach the Dharma to an assembly in such a way that they are unable to know if he were a human or a divine being.⁴⁷

3.7.2 Both versions of the Sutta state that the Buddha’s appearing in the 8 assemblies as another example of his possession of supernormal powers, thereby debunking Sunakkhatta’s false accusations.

3.8 THE 4 KINDS OF BIRTH [§§32-34]. Next, the Sutta describes **the 4 ways of birth (yonī)**, presenting the Buddha’s knowledge of these as further evidence that he has supernormal powers [§32].⁴⁸ The 4 ways of birth are, however, not mentioned in its Chinese parallel.

3.9 THE 5 DESTINIES AND NIRVANA [§§35-43]

3.9.1 Both the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta and its Chinese version next turn to the Buddha’s knowledge of **the different destinies (gati) of beings**. According to the Vibhaṅga, this knowledge is an example of one of the 10 tathagata powers, namely his knowledge of the paths to any destiny (Vbh 339,10). This section of the Sutta and its Chinese version, as such, can be seen as drawing out in more detail an aspect of their previous description of the 10 powers.

3.9.2 According to the Sutta, this type of knowledge comprises knowing the path that leads to rebirth in hell, as an animal, as a preta, as a human, as a god, and a path that leads to nirvana [§§35-36].⁴⁹ The Chinese version mentions the same destinies, but also adds rebirth as an asura demon.⁵⁰ According to both versions, the Buddha’s knowledge of such destinies entails his ability to predict that someone with a cer-

⁴⁷ T757 @ T17.593c26. A nearly identical passage is found in **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.21-23/2:109,10), SD 9 (with a Skt counterpart in S 360 folio 179R3 in Waldschmidt, *Das Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra*, Berlin, 1950:22) and in **Parisā S** (A 8.69/4:307 f).

⁴⁸ The 4 ways of birth (yonī) recur in D 33/3:230,22 (*catasso yoniyo*) and its parallel, DĀ 9 @ T1.50c8: 四生 *sī shēng*, in fragment K 484 (53)Vd in Stache-Rosen 1968:26 (*(a)ṇḍajā yonir*), and in EĀ 25.5 @ T2.632a8; cf S 29.1-2/3:240-241, S 30.1-2/3:246-247, and Mahā,vyutpatti no 2279-2282 (Sakaki 1926:168). The more detailed explanation of each way of birth in M 12 occurs with further details in Saṅgīti,pariyāya (T1536 @ T26.403b20, tr in Stache-Rosen 1968:110). Windisch draws attention to a similar presentation of 4 yonis in the Aitareya Upaniṣad 3.1.3, which differs in including “birth from a seed” as fourth, instead of spontaneous birth (1908:191); see also Schmit-hausen 1991: 79 f. The Jain text, Tḥāṇaṅga 7.543, lists 7 yonis (Jambūvijaya 1985:221,19) and Tḥāṇaṅga 8.595 lists 8 yonis (Jambūvijaya 1985:243,6).

⁴⁹ On representations of the destinies in Indian art, esp the wheel of life (*bhava,cakra*), see eg Leoshko 2000/2001: 72-74, Mejer 2010, Przyłuski 1920, Schlingloff 1988:167-174 + 2000 plate xvii, 20, von Simson 2010, Zin 2003a: 440-456 + 2007; on the same in China, see eg Teiser 2004b.

⁵⁰ T757 @ T17.594b8. Asuras are mentioned as a realm in D 33/3:264,11, It 3.5:4/93,1, Tha 1128 and Thī 475, while only the 5 births, omitting the asuras (as in M 12) are listed in D 33/3:234,8 and A 9.68/4:459,14. Kathā,vatthu and *Mahā,vibhāṣā reject the inclusion of a 6th destiny (Kvu 360,1; T1545 @ T27.868b2). Kvu Comy identifies those who assert 6 destinies to be the Andhakas and the Uttara,pathakas (KvuA 104,2), which means that the mention of 6 destinies in T757 suggest another affinity of this text with Mahāsaṅghika tradition (Analayo 2011:114 & 108 n48). Alternatively, the tendency to add the asuras to various listings could be a general pattern: for another instance, see Przyłuski 1927:118-119; on the difficulties concerning the asuras as a fourth bad destiny, see Bodhi 2005:435 n5; and for a survey of refs to 5 or 6 destinies, see Lamotte 1958/1988:629-630 & 1970/1976:1956-1957. Jaini qu Sarvārthasiddhi 265 (a Jain text) as mentioning only 4 destinies: the realms of hell-beings, of animals, of humans, and of devas (*gatiś catur,bhedā, naraka,gatis tiryag,gatir manuṣya,gatir deva,gatir iti*) (1979:108 n3). On pretas, see Law 1923/1997.

tain mental inclination and habitual conduct will be reborn in a particular realm, and then witnessing with his divine eye that this has indeed occurred.

3.9.3 The two versions illustrate the different destinies with the predicament of a tired and thirsty traveller on a hot day. This parable shows the following correspondences for the various types of rebirth:

- as a hell-being: falling into a blazing pit,
- as an animal: falling into a cesspit,
- as a preta: trying to rest under a tree with little foliage on a hot day,
- as a human being: resting in the shade of a tree with thick foliage,
- as a deva: resting in a beautiful mansion.

The Chinese version includes rebirth as an asura demon, which it compares to one trying to rest under a small tree covered with ants.⁵¹

Both versions then compare realization of nirvana to being able to drink and bathe in a beautiful lotus pond, where only the thirsty and tired man is really able to relieve himself of his afflictions.⁵²

A parallel to the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta's account of the Buddha's knowledge of the different destinies is found in the Ekottarika Āgama.⁵³ It agrees closely with the Sutta's description, and does not mention the asuras.⁵⁴ In fact, the older set has only the "5 destinies," that is, the deva, the human, the preta, the animal and the hell realms, without the asura realm.⁵⁵

3.10 THE BODHISATTVA'S AUSTERITIES [§§44-61]

3.10.1 The fourfold austerities [§§44-48]

3.10.1.1 The Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta continues by presenting the Buddha's former practice of **4 types of asceticism** [§44]. This same account is also found in the Chinese parallel,⁵⁶ where it forms part of the Buddha's examination and rejection of different theories on purification held by contemporary recluses and brahmins.

According to both versions, the Bodhisattva engages in various austerities common in ancient India then, such as accepting food only under specific circumstances and at specified intervals, not cleaning the body, living in extreme seclusion, and exposing the body to the inclemencies of the weather. These austerities have reported in other suttas as examples of futile, even harmful, asceticism.⁵⁷

3.10.1.2 Is there any contradiction between the Buddha's criticism of these practices voiced in other discourses and the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta statement that they have been practised by the Bodhisattva? It should be noted that there is, in fact, a positive account of the Bodhisattva practising these austerities in the Loma,haṃsa Jātaka (J 94) [1.3.3].

According to this Jātaka, 91 aeons (world-cycles) ago, the Bodhisattva was a naked ascetic who practised these austerities.⁵⁸ In fact, some aspects of the austerities described in this part of the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta would not fit too well with the narrative of the present and last life of the Buddha.

⁵¹ T757 @ T17.595a16.

⁵² Cf H Hecker, *Similes of the Buddha*, Kandy, 2009:12.

⁵³ EĀ 50.6 @ T2.811b1.

⁵⁴ Another parallel is that EĀ 50.6 @ T2.812b11 also mentions the 10 powers.

⁵⁵ See (**Pañca**) **Gatī S** (A 9.68), SD 2.20.

⁵⁶ T757 @ T17.597a7: 修四種之法 *xiū sì zhǒng zhī fǎ*. A partial parallel to this account of austerities in M 12 and T757 can be found in EĀ 31.8 @ T2.670c3, which reports that the Buddha exposes himself to the inclemencies of the weather, dwells in a cemetery, and feeds on cow dung. EĀ 31.8 continues with a description of the Buddha's austerities and awakening which parallels the account in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36/1:242,23), SD 49.4.

⁵⁷ **Kandaraka S** (M 51/1:342,25), SD 32.9; **Ghoṭa,mukha S** (M 94/2:161,26), SD 96.7; (**Tika**) **Paṭipadā S 1** (A 3.151/1:295,8), SD 78.6; and **Attan Tapa S** (A 4.198/2:206,7), SD 56.7. For an examination of the austerities described in such listings, see Bollée 1971.

⁵⁸ J 94/1:390,16: "In the past, 91 aeons ago, the Bodhisattva ... renounced as an ajivika, as a naked ascetic covered in dust and dirt" (*atīte eka,navuti,kappa,matthake bodhisatto ... ājīvika,pabbajjam pabbajitvā acelako ahosi rajo,-jalliko*): see Hecker 1972:54. This Jātaka story begins by referring to Sunakkhatta's disparagement of the Buddha, which clearly shows that it refers to the same occasion as that of M 12 [§2].

3.10.1.3 **Dutoit** notes that the account of the Bodhisattva's solitary dwelling in a forest [§48], when he would hide as soon as he sees a cowherd, a shepherd or anyone from afar, contradicts the traditional account of the Bodhisattva practising austerities in the company of the 5 monks. Dutoit also points out an inner contradiction, where §45 (M 1:78,19) describes the Bodhisattva ritually washes (in the river) thrice a day, but then later [§46] (M 1:78,23) describes how dust and dirt accumulate on his body over time so that they fall off in dried pieces. (1905:50)

3.10.1.4 Furthermore, **Freiberger** notes another contradiction between the reference to nakedness [§45] (M 1:77,28), and later in the same passage, mentions the wearing of different types of ascetic garment (M 1:78,10) (2006:238).

3.10.1.5 All these practices would indeed only fit a description of a whole past life of asceticism, or even of several lives, where at one stage, the Bodhisattva might have undertaken the practice of ritual bathing, and, in due course, completely stopped washing until the dirt accumulated on his body and fell off in pieces; or at one stage, he practised nakedness, and, in due course, worn various ascetic garments.

3.10.1.6 This explanation would support the fact that these accounts do not refer to the Bodhisattva undergoing all these practices during his ascetic years in his last life. Thus, the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta's treatment of these 4 types of asceticism appears to be only a part of the Buddha's account of his experiments with various practices and methods of asceticism and purification during former lives. The purpose of this account is, of course, to show that he has experienced all the practices of the time, and even beyond that, so that he speaks from a full experience of the religious life as conceived then.

3.10.2 The other austerities [§§49-61]

3.10.2.1 Both the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta and its Chinese version go on to describe several other ascetic practices of the Bodhisattva in his former lives. After experiencing them, he realizes that they are ineffective in bringing self-purification or self-awakening [§§49-56]. Our understanding here is that he also tries some of these ascetic practices, or all of them over different times during his 7 years of self-mortification in his last life.

3.10.2.2 In regard to the view that purification can be effected through a particular type of rebirth, for example, both versions state that he has already experienced all types of rebirth, except rebirth in the Pure Abodes (only for non-returns). If he had been born there, he would not have returned to this world [§§57-59].⁵⁹

3.10.3 Purification through rituals

3.10.3.1 The Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta then describes how the Bodhisattva has himself performed—when he is reborn as “either a head-anointed noble king or a wealthy brahmin”—all kinds of rituals, including brahminical sacrifices (*yañña*) and fire-worship (*aggi,paricariyā*), which are purported to purify and liberate us [§§60-61]. None of them work at all. All this the Buddha knows through his knowledge of recalling his own past lives.

This episode, however, is not found in the Chinese version. On the other hand, scholars have noted that there is a fragment of a Sanskrit version of this account that appears to report such an examination of the different purification theories with the wisdom of the theme of a young man who ages with time, paralleling §62 (M 1:82,22).⁶⁰

3.10.3.2 However, the Chinese verse here departs from the sequence of accounts of the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta, by instead giving the following details:

- the Buddha's present life asceticism,
- his memory of a former attaining of the first dhyana (as a child),
- his decision to give up asceticism and take nourishment, which causes his 5 monks to abandon him,
- his development of the 4 dhyanas and his awakening.⁶¹

⁵⁹ M 1:82,1 and T 757 @ T17.596b20; see also EĀ 31.8 @ T2.672a18.

⁶⁰ Line R6 of an unnumbered Skt fragment from the Hoernle collection, no135 (Hartmann 1991: 241).

⁶¹ T757 @ T17.599a14 (memory of first dhyana) and T757 @ T17.599c11 (destruction of the influxes).

This part of the Chinese discourse thus parallels the account of the Buddha's progress to awakening as recounted in **the Mahā Saccaka Sutta** (M 36).⁶² It is possible that the Chinese version is translated from a text that incorporates these M 36 episodes mentioned.

3.11 THE BUDDHA'S MENTAL LUCIDITY [§§61-63]

3.11.1 Towards the end, the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta goes on to record the Buddha as declaring that despite his advanced age (he is 80 years old), he is still in full possession of his wisdom and lucidity. His mental acumen is such that he would be able to discuss the 4 satipatthanas with four disciples for a hundred years without running short of explanations [§62.2].⁶³ Only parts of this declaration are found in the Chinese parallel.⁶⁴

3.12 THE SUTTA CONCLUSION [§64]. The Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta and its Chinese parallel conclude by reporting that a monk, fanning the Buddha [§64], declares that, on hearing this discourse, his hair stands up in ecstasy, on account of which the Buddha dubs this Sutta as the "hair-raising exposition." [§64]⁶⁵

4 The 12 kinds of holy life

4.0 A COMMENTARIAL TRADITION. Buddhaghosa, in his Sutta commentary, cites the Bodhisattva's practice of the fourfold austerities as an example of the "holy life of effort" (*virīya brahma, cariya*). He gives a list of 12 kinds of "holy life" (*brahma, cariya*) to explain the context of the "holy life comprising 4 factors" (*catur-aṅga, samannāgata brahma, cariya*) or "4-factored holy life" [§44],⁶⁶ explained in detail in this Sutta [§§45-48] with their related practices [§§49-56]. The 12 kinds of holy life are as follows, that is to say:

(1) giving;	<i>dāna brahma, cariya</i>
(2) service;	<i>veyyāvacca brahma, cariya</i>
(3) the training-steps;	<i>sikkhā, pada brahma, cariya</i>
(4) the divine abodes;	<i>brahma, vihāra brahma, cariya</i>
(5) teaching the Dharma;	<i>dhamma, desanā brahma, cariya</i>
(6) celibacy;	<i>methuna, virati brahma, cariya</i>
(7) satisfaction in one's own wife	<i>sa. dāra, santosa brahma, cariya</i>
(8) the precept-day observation	<i>uposatha brahma, cariya</i>
(9) the noble path;	<i>ariya, magga brahma, cariya</i>
(10) the whole teaching; and	<i>sakala, sāsana brahma, cariya</i>
(11) inclination, and	<i>ajjhāsaya brahma, cariya</i>
(12) effort.	<i>virīya brahma, cariya</i>

(MA 2:41-43)

4.1 THE HOLY LIFE OF GIVING (*dāna brahma, cariya*). Buddhaghosa, in his Jātaka Commentary gives the example of the serpent-king, Varuṇa (J 2:256), and his wife, Vimalā (J 6:262), in **the Puṇṇaka Jātaka**, the name he used for the better known title **Vidhura Paṇḍita Jātaka** (J 545), which illustrates

⁶² M 36/1:246,31.

⁶³ M 1:82,32. The Buddha's ability to teach on the cultivation of mindfulness for a period of 100 years to four disciples, whose mental acumen is comparable to a skilled archer, can also be found as a separate discourse in SĀ 612 (T2.171c7), tr in Hurvitz 1978:220. Another relevant text is MĀ 163 (T1.693c7), which also illustrates the inexhaustibility of the Buddha's teaching with his ability to explain the Dharma to four disciples continuously for 100 years (except for the time required to nourish, relieve and rest their bodies), but it does not mention the 4 satipatthanas: see Analayo 2011:785.

⁶⁴ T757 (T17.599c18) agrees with M 12 in reporting that some recluses and brahmins hold the view that the wisdom of a young man will be lost with old age. T757 @ T17.600a7 also speaks of disciples endowed with a long life who question the Buddha. Other parts of this account in T757, however, differ considerably from M 12, for instance, T757 (T17.600a21) does not mention *satipatthāna*, but instead reports that the Buddha would teach on pleasure, pain, and neither-pleasure nor-pain (the 3 kinds of feeling).

⁶⁵ M 1:83,19 and T757 (T17.600a24).

⁶⁶ MA 2:41-43.

the Bodhisattva's perfection of wisdom. In this Jātaka, Varuna the serpent-king, was asked about the source of his great blessings:

[The Bodhisattva:]

*Kim te vataṃ kiṃ pana brahma,cariyaṃ
kissa suciṇṇassa ayaṃ vipāko
iddhī juṭī bala,vīriyūpapatti
idaṇ,ca te nāga mahā,vimānaṃ*

What was your vow, and what was your holy life?
Of what purity was this the fruit of
success, radiance, power, heroic birth,
and this great mansion of yours, O naga?

[The serpent-king:]

*Ahañ ca bhariyā ca manussa,loke
saddhā ubho dāna,paṭi ahumhā
opāna,bhūtaṃ me gharaṃ tadāsi
santappitā samaṇa,brāhmaṇā ca*

In the human world, my wife and I
both are master-givers, full of faith.
My house was then a well-spring
that satisfied recluses and brahmins.

*Taṃ me vataṃ taṃ pana brahma,cariyaṃ
tassa suciṇṇassa ayaṃ vipāko
iddhī juṭī bala,vīriyūpapatti
idaṇ ca me dhīra mahā,vimānaṃ 'ti*

That was my vow, that my holy life, too,
this is the fruit of that purity,
success, radiance, power, heroic birth
and this great mansion, O wise one.

(J verses 5763, 5737, 5739 @ J 545/J 6:316)

4.2 THE HOLY LIFE OF SERVICE (*veyyāvacca brahma,cariya*) is defined in **the Aṅkura Peta,vatthu** (Pv 21). Interestingly here, Aṅkura is not a preta, but the name is only the title of the preta story connected to him (Pv 111). Aṅkura, with his caravan of 500 carts, and a brahmin, with another 500 carts, are travelling from Dvāra,vatī to Kambojā. Midway, they are lost, and badly need water.

They are saved by a powerful yaksha who was Aṅkura's faithful servant in his past life. Although he does not himself give alms, he rejoices in the generosity of others. On account of this merit, he is able, as a yaksha, to grant wishes by just raising his right hand.

[Yaksha:]

*Tena pāṇi kāma,dado
kena pāṇi madhussavo
kena me brahma,cariyena
puññaṃ pāṇimhi ijjhati*

For this reason, your hand grants wishes.
For that reason, your hand flows with honey.
By my holy life,
merit is accomplished in this hand. (Pv 275)

[Aṅkura:]

*Tena pāṇi kāma,dado
tena pāṇi madhussavo
tena te brahma,cariyena
puññaṃ pāṇimhi ijjhatīti*

For that reason, my hand grants wishes.
For that reason, my hand flows with honey.
By your holy life,
merit is accomplished in this hand. (Pv 277)

(Pv 2.9/275+277/33)

4.3 THE HOLY LIFE OF THE TRAINING-STEPS (*sikkhā,pada brahma,cariya*). There were once three friends, a partridge (*tittira*), a monkey and a bull-elephant, living near a large banyan tree on a slope of the Himalaya. When they compared their respective memories of the banyan tree, the partridge (who said that he was the one who dropped its seed there) is revealed to be the eldest of them, they honour him as their teacher and he gives them counsel.

The Vinaya, quoting the Dīgha Commentary, states that their conduct came to be known as **the “partridge holy life”** (*tittiriya,brahma,cariya*).⁶⁷ The Majjhima Commentary calls it the “5-precept holy life” (*pañca,sikkhā,pada brahma,cariya*) (MA 2:42,18). The Bodhisattva was the partridge, Moggallāna the elephant, and Sāriputta the monkey.

⁶⁷ V 2:162, qu from DA 1:178.

The story is related in reference to the failure of the notorious group of 6 monks (*cha-b, baggiya*) to show due respect to Sāriputta. Once, when he goes with them to visit the Buddha, they refuse to provide him with lodging, and he has to sleep under a tree.⁶⁸

4.4 THE HOLY LIFE OF THE DIVINE ABODES (*brahma, vihāra brahma, cariya*). Buddhaghosa quotes, **the Mahā Govinda Sutta** (D 19) for an example of this. According to the Sutta, in a Jātaka related by the gandharva Pañca, sikha, in the time of the ancient king, Reṇu, his chaplain, Mahā Govinda, practises the divine abodes for 4 months, so that he would be able to see Brahma, and he succeeds in doing so. At the end of the story, the Buddha declares that he is himself Mahā Govinda in that Jātaka. Then, he admonishes Pañca, sikha, thus:

But, Pañca, sikha, that kind of holy life does *not* lead to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana,⁶⁹ but only to rebirth in the Brahma world. (D 19/2:251)

The Buddha then declares that his holy life, that is, the noble eightfold path, *does* lead to revulsion with what brings about suffering and leads to suffering's ending, that is, nirvana. [4.9]

4.5 THE HOLY LIFE OF TEACHING THE DHARMA (*dhamma, desanā brahma, cariya*) records how one dark, drizzling night, Brahmā appears to the Buddha and says these words:

<i>Ekasmim brahma, cariyasmim</i>	Within a single holy life,	
<i>sahassam maccu, hāyinan'ti</i>	a thousand have abandoned death.	(S 6.13/1:154)

4.6 THE HOLY LIFE OF CELIBACY (*methuna, virati brahma, cariya*) is a common theme, such as this instruction on effacement (*sallekha*) given by the Buddha to Mahā Cunda, that is, on how to properly progress on the spiritual path:

Others may not be celibate, but here I will be a brahmachari [one who lives the holy life].

Pare abrahmacārī bhavissanti, mayamettha brahmacārī bhavissāmā'ti (M 8,12(4)/1:42)

4.7 THE HOLY LIFE OF SATISFACTION IN ONE'S OWN WIFE (*sa. dāra, santosa brahma, cariya*). In **the Mahā Dhamma, pāla Jātaka** (J 447), the brahmin (the Buddha in this past life), when asked why, in his family, no one died young, declares that he keeps to the holy life of celibacy, thus,

<i>Mayañ ca bhariyā nātikkamāma</i>	We do not betray our wives,	
<i>amhe ca bhariyā nātikkamanti</i>	nor do we transgress the wives of others.	
<i>aññatra tāhi brahma, cariyam carāma</i>	Towards others, we practise celibacy.	
<i>tasmā hi amham daharā na mīyare'ti</i>	As such, our young do not die.	(J 447/4:53)

4.8 THE HOLY LIFE OF THE PRECEPT-DAY OBSERVATION (*uposatha brahma, cariya*). In **the Nimi Jātaka** (J 541), the Bodhisattva declares how he tames himself by keeping to the eightfold observance⁷⁰ (*aṭṭhaṅgika uposatha*), thus:

<i>Hīnena brahma. cariyena</i>	On account of a lowly holy life,
<i>khattiye upapajjati</i>	he is reborn amongst the kshatriyas,
<i>majjhimena ca devattam</i>	by a middling one, the deva-state,
<i>uttamena visujjhatīti</i>	but through the highest, he was purified.
	(J 541/6:98)

4.9 THE HOLY LIFE OF THE NOBLE PATH (*ariya, magga brahma, cariya*). According to **the Mahā Govinda Sutta** (D 19), in a Jātaka related by the gandharva Pañca, sikha, in the time of the ancient king, Reṇu, his chaplain, Mahā Govinda, practises the divine abodes for 4 months, so that he would be able to

⁶⁸ J 37/1:217 ff; cf V 2:161; Avadāna, śataka 2.17.

⁶⁹ See *Nibbidā*, SD 20.1 (2.2).

⁷⁰ On this eightfold observance (*aṭṭh'āṅgika uposatha*), see **Tad-ah'uposatha S** (A 3.70), SD 4.18.

see Brahmā, and he succeeds in doing so. At the end of the story, the Buddha declares that he is himself Mahā Govinda in that Jātaka, and that the holy life, that is, the divine abodes, does not bring awakening. Then, he admonishes Pañca,sikha, thus:

But, Pañca,sikha, that holy life certainly leads to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana,⁷¹ that is, this very noble eightfold path. (D 19/2:251) [4.4]

4.10 THE HOLY LIFE OF THE WHOLE TEACHING (*sakala,sāsana brahma,cariya*). In the **Pāsādika Sutta** (D 29), the Buddha tells Cunda that his teachings in practice, that is, as the holy life is still widely found, that is, the “holy life as the whole teaching,” thus:

Tay-idaṃ brahma,cariyaṃ iddhañ c’eva phītañ ca vitthārikaṃ bāhu,jaññaṃ puthu,bhūtaṃ yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṃ’ti

This holy life itself prospers and flourishes, widely spread amongst the masses, to the extent of being well proclaimed amongst devas and humans. (D 29,15.11/3:126), SD 40a.6

4.11 THE HOLY LIFE OF INCLINATION (*ajjhāsaya brahma,cariya*). In the **Gāmaṇi Jātaka** (J 8), the youngest of 100 brothers who are kings, and the wisest of them, receive counsel from the Bodhisattva. Recollecting his good fortune, that youngest of the kings joyfully exclaims:

*Api ataramānānaṃ
phal’āsā va samijjhati
vipakka,brahma.cariyo’smi
evaṃ jānāhi gāmaṇīti*

Indeed, for those who walk slowly,
the fruits of hope [desire] take effect.
I’m one whose holy life has ripened:
know thus, Gāmaṇi!

(J 8/1:136)

4.12 THE HOLY LIFE OF EFFORT (*virīya brahma,cariya*). The example of this form of holy life is found in this Sutta itself. This is spoken in connection with one of his births (*atta,bhāva*), regarding his performance of the “holy life comprising 4 factors” (*catur-aṅga,samannāgata brahma,cariya*) or “4-factored holy life” [§44]. (MA 2:43).

5 Sunakkhatta

5.1 SUNAKKHATTA AS A MONK

5.1.1 Sunakkhatta is a Licchavī prince of Vesālī. At one time, he is a member of the community and the Buddha’s personal attendant (*anibaddha,upatthāka*). He is probably a member of the order 24 years before Ānanda takes over as the Buddha’s personal attendant.

5.1.2 The Mahāli Sutta (D 6) recounts the Licchavī Mahāli, nick-named Oṭṭh’addha (the hare-lipped), relating to the Buddha how Sunakkhatta comes to him three years after joining the order, claiming that he could see divine forms, but could not hear heavenly sounds. The Sutta explains that he has developed only a one-sided mental concentration (D 1:153).⁷²

Buddhaghosa, however, explains that he is unable to attain the power of hearing divine sounds because in a previous birth he ruptured the ear drum of a virtuous monk and made him deaf (DA 1:152, 311).

5.2 SUNAKKHATTA’S GRIEVANCE

5.2.1 Sunakkhatta’s grievance is that the Buddha shows no psychic wonders, and that he has not shown him the origin of things. The Buddha reminds him that he has not promised to do any of these things, and that, at one time, Sunakkhatta has been loud in his praise of the Buddha and the Dharma. The Buddha warns him that people would say he has left the order because its discipline has proved too hard for him.

⁷¹ See *Nibbidā*, SD 20.1 (2.2).

⁷² D 6,5/1:153 @ SD 53.4.

The Sunakkhatta Sutta (M 105) records the Buddha's teaching to Sunakkhatta before he joins the order,⁷³ while **the Paṭika Sutta** (D 24) gives an account of his dissatisfaction, followed by his defection.⁷⁴ He is dissatisfied with the Buddha because the Buddha refuses to perform any miracles for him, or to explain to him the origin of things.

5.2.2 Sāriputta, on his alms-rounds in Vesālī, hears of Sunakkhatta's denunciation of the Buddha. He reports it to the Buddha, who then teaches **the Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta** (M 12) and **the Loma,haṃsa Jātaka** (J 94).⁷⁵ According to the Sutta, the Buddha is, at this time, 80 years old (M 1:82).

5.2.3 Later, however, Sunakkhatta converts to the views of dog-vow naked ascetic Kora-k,khattiya of Uttarakā.⁷⁶ Then, Sunakkhatta goes about defaming the Buddha, saying that he has nothing superhuman and is not distinguished from other men by teaching the total end of suffering.

The Buddha tells him that Kora-k,khattiya, whom he so much admires, would be born after death among the Kāla,kañjaka asuras within seven days. It happens as the Buddha prophesied, and the dead body of Kora shows that he is right. Even so, Sunakkhatta is not convinced.

5.2.4 Later, Sunakkhatta transfers his allegiance to Kandara,masaka, who dies, as the Buddha prophesies, fallen from grace and fame. Sunakkhatta then turns to Pāṭika,putta, and wishes the Buddha to pay honour to him. The Buddha, however, reminds Sunakkhatta of the words of Ajita, the Licchavī general, who has been born in Tāvātimsa, to the effect that Pāṭika,putta is "a liar and a cheat," which later proves to be true. Sunakkhatta still does not return to the order.

5.3 SUNAKKHATTA'S FATE

5.3.1 Even after being close to the Buddha as his personal attendant for 24 years, Sunakkhatta, says the Sutta, sees no difference between himself and the Buddha, apart from the fact that the Buddha has a six-foot aura. It is said that a week after leaving the order, Sunakkhatta dies and is reborn as a preta. As such, his story is often told as a cautionary tale against disparaging one's teacher.

5.3.2 According to the Chinese version of the Mahā Parinirvāṇa Sūtra in Sanskrit, Sunakṣetra (the Sanskrit form of his name) is able to attain all the 4 dhyanas, but later, under the influence of other teachers, comes to lose faith in the Buddha.

5.3.3 Sunakkhatta is identified as Kānārittha (Ariṭṭha the blind) of **the Bhūridatta Jātaka** (J 543). He is one of the four sons of the naga-king Dhata,raṭṭha and his queen Samudda,jā, the others being Sudassana, Bhūridatta and Subhaga. He is the cruelest of the brothers, while Bhūri,datta is the Bodhisattva himself.⁷⁷

6 Some translation critical notes

L S Cousins, in his "Review of Ñānamoli & Bodhi, *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha*," (1995),⁷⁸ made some very insightful and helpful observations of some important words and expressions, comparing the three main versions we have of the translations of **M 12**, that is, those by (1) I B Horner = **IBH** (1954), (2) Ñānamoli Thera edited by Phra Khantipālo = **Kh** (no date), and (3) Bhikkhu Bodhi = **Bo** (1995); and also (4) K R Norman = KRN's translation of the Sutta Nipāta (1992). The imprint details of the various translations, along with the Pali text, are as follows (with corrections of typos), followed by Cousins' critical notes, with standardized referencing and [additional notes within square brackets].

Bo = Bhikkhu Bodhi (& Bhikkhu Ñānamoli), (tr) *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha*, Somerville, MA: Wisdom Publications, 1995. (2nd ed 2001; 3rd ed 2005; 4th ed 2009.)

Ee = [European edition of Pali text] V Trenckner and Robert Chalmers, (eds) Majjhima-nikāya, Pali Text Society, [1888-99], 1964, 1977, 1960.

⁷³ M 105/2:252-261 @ SD 94.3.

⁷⁴ D 24/3:1-35 @ SD 63.3.

⁷⁵ J 94/1:389 f; see also J 4:95.

⁷⁶ D 3:6 ff; J 1:389 f.

⁷⁷ J 543/6:219.

⁷⁸ <http://www.buddhistethics.org/4/cous1.pdf> (1997:264-269).

Kh = Ñāṇamoli Thera, (tr) *A Treasury of the Buddha's Words*, (ed) Phra Khantipalo, Bangkok: Mahāmakut, nd, 3 volumes.

IBH = I B Horner, (tr) *Middle Length Sayings*, London: Pali Text Society, 1954-59, repr 1975-87, 3 volumes.

KRN = K R Norman, (tr) *The Group of Discourses II*, Oxford: Pali Text Society, 1992.

Sutta 12: (pages) Bo 164-78; Kh 3:238-56; IBH 1:91-110.

§1 and §42 *vana,saṇḍe-*

Bo has “grove” in the first case and “wood” in the second. This is less exact than IBH “woodland thicket” or “forest thicket” and confuses its difference from *vana-* (also rendered “grove”). Both versions obscure the link between the location of the Sutta and the simile.

[There is also *vana,daya*, “forest grove” (eg *go.sīṅga,sala,vana,dāya*, M 31,2 @ SD 44.11). Where *vana* is wild, it should be translated as “forest”; where it is tended or cultivated, it should be rendered “grove.” *Miga,dāya* or *miga,dāya,vana* is well known as “the deer park,” so it is easier to leave it that way.]

§2 *uttari(n),manussa,dhamma-*

Bo “superhuman states”; Kh “higher than the human state (*dhamma*)”; IBH “states of further men.” The issue is whether it is the *dhammas* or the *manussa* who are *uttari-*. Since forms of *uttarimanussa-* occur in both senses, there is a case for both, although it is likely that the older interpretation is that adopted by Bo.

§2 *yassa ca khvāssa atthāya*

Bo “when he teaches the Dhamma to anyone”; Kh “whoever is taught that *dhamma* for his benefit”; IBH “and says that *dhamma*, taught for the sake of something specific.” Bo is certainly the best rendering, but none translate *assa*. Literally: “the one for whose sake his dhamma is taught,” but more idiomatically: “when he teaches his dhamma to anyone.” (The speaker is not a follower of the Buddha.)

§2 *so niyyāti takkarassa sammā,dukkha-k,khayāyāti*

All three follow the commentary in referring back to *dhammo*. This creates a number of problems as Buddhaghosa obviously recognized. (He solves them by claiming that Sunakkhatta did not dare to say what he intended to say, because of fear of criticism by the large number of enlightened followers of the Buddha in the city.) More probably, *takkarassa* is for *takkaro assa*. Sunakkhatta intended to say: “When he teaches his *dhamma* to anyone, the person who puts that into practice is setting out for the complete destruction of his suffering.” But the Buddha either chooses to take it as Buddhaghosa does or, more probably, takes *niyyāti* as meaning “exits,” that is, departs *samsāra*. (Cf SED: *niryā* + dative.)

§2 and below *parisatīm*

Bo “before the Vesālā assembly”; IBH “to a group (of people) at Vesālī.” It could equally be rendered “in an assembly at Vesālī.” It is not clear why Kh omits this at the second occurrence, unless it was thought that Sāriputta would not have heard Sunakkhatta speaking at the assembly. Presumably, that is also the reason for IBH’s rendering.

§§5-8 *iti pi so bhagavā*

This is better rendered by Kh, but wrongly by both IBH and Bo. The phrase means “He is a Bhagavat for the following reasons, too”: (cf CPD 2:278). This, of course, explains the double occurrence of the word Bhagavā.

§5 *sugato*

It is doubtful if this can mean “sublime” (Bo).

§6 *iddhi,vidhā*

Bo “supernormal power”; IBH “psychic power”; cp CPD “magic power.” All of these gratuitously introduce the word “power.” Much better is Kh “(supernormal) success,” although even that introduces the word supernormal for no good reason. The original simply says: “experiences manifold kinds of achievement.”

§6 *āvibhāvaṃ tiro,bhāvaṃ*

Bo “he appears and vanishes”; IBH “manifest or invisible.” More probably this refers to the capacity to make things appear and disappear (to his own vision?). Cf Pm 2:207.

§8 *cetasā ceto paricca*

Bo “encompasses with his (own) mind the minds of.” This is better than IBH “by mind the minds of.” [It is perhaps better to render *paricca* as “fully grasping,” rather than “encompass,” which suggest grasping something bigger.]

§10 *ñhānaṃ ca ñhānato*

Bo “the possible as possible.” This is much better than IBH “causal occasion.”

§12 *sabb’attha,gāminiṃ paṭipadaṃ*

Bo “the ways leading to all destinations”; Kh “whither all ways lead”; IBH “the course leading to all bourns”; cf BHSD sv *pratipad* “courses of conduct which may lead to any result.” There is a tendency in the commentaries to interpret this in terms of the five gatis (probably following the Abhidhamma cf Vbh 339), although VbhA 400 specifies “both those leading to (one of) the *gati* and those not leading to a *gati*.” It may be that *sabbattha* was sometimes interpreted as *sabba + attha*. Edgerton is probably right to argue that *paṭipadā* does not mean “way” but “course of conduct, behavior.” So perhaps literally: “he understands behavior, whithersoever it leads.”

Note that without the *abhidhamma* rendering there would be no obstacle to translating: “he understands the all-pervading (universal) course of conduct.” Also, Peṭk 34-35 seems to understand as “behavior that can lead anywhere” as opposed to behavior which leads necessarily to *nibbāna* or an *apāya*.

§15 *indriya’parôpariyattaṃ*

Bo “the disposition of the faculties”; IBH is clearer: “higher or lower state of the faculties.”

§21 *maṃ evaṃ jānantaṃ evaṃ passantaṃ*

Bo “when I know and see thus” corrects both Kh “knowing and seeing me thus” and IBH “knowing me thus, seeing me thus.”

§21 *yathā,bhataṃ nikkhitto*

Bo “as [surely as if he had been] carried off and put there he will wind up” (Kh is similar). This is more plausible than IBH “he is consigned to,” “just as a burden is laid aside.” Cf Nett 131.

§22-28 the 4 *vesārajja*

Bo “intrepidity”; IBH “convictions.” Since this certainly refers to four matters in regard to which the Buddha could have no valid reason to fear criticism, the former is more to the point, if a little clumsy. [The 4 ~ are given in detail at M 1:71-72.]

§25 *antarāya*

Bo “obstructions”; Kh “obstructive”; IBH “stumbling blocks.”

§29 *māra,parisā*

Bo “an assembly of Māra’s retinue”; Kh “a Māra’s assembly”; IBH “Māra’s assemblies.” Here Bo is not a translation, but incorporates, perhaps wrongly, the explanation of the commentary.

§32 the 4 *yoni*

Bo “kinds of birth” is clearly better than IBH “modes of life,” since *yonī* must mean “source” or “place of birth.”

§33 *vatthi,kosa*

Bo “caul” is no doubt better than IBH “membraneous sheath.”

§35 the 5 *gati*

Bo “destination” is certainly better than IBH “bourn.”

§35 *pitti,visaya* (v1 *petti,visayo*)

Bo “realm of ghosts” obscures the difference between *peta-* and *pitti-/petti-*; IBH “realm of the departed” is more accurate.

§36 *yathā,paṭipanno*

Bo “how one who has entered this path”; Kh “whereon he who has entered”; IBH “according to how one is faring along.” Better: “behaving in accordance with which” or “practising in accordance with which” (despite PED).

§37 *tathā . . . yathā*

Bo “so . . . that” is correct here, as against IBH “As . . . so.”

§37 *ekanta,dukkhā*

Bo “extremely painful”; Kh “unremitting, painful”; IBH “exclusively painful.” Despite CPD, Bo is incorrect here and below. [§38]

§37 *ek’āyanena*

Bo “going in one way only” is undoubtedly correct, as against IBH “by the one sole way.”

§38 *dukkhā*

Here Bo translates it erroneously as “extremely painful,” thus obscuring the difference between *niraya* and animal rebirths. Kh and IBH are correct. [§37]

§41 *pāsādo*

Bo “mansion”; IBH “long house.” This is often rendered “palace.” It may sometimes refer to a single, multi-storied building with many rooms, but (more often) it probably refers to a number of adjoining but more or less separate mostly single-storied buildings on the same site.

§41 *kūṭ’āgāraṃ*

Bo “upper chamber”; IBH “building with a gabled roof.” Originally, this was a “gabled house,” that is, one with a horseshoe-shaped gable, probably outside a village and used for ritual purposes. Later, the same type of design was used for (Buddhist) shrine-halls and even for palanquins and elaborate biers and (in a secular context) for any chamber in a *pāsāda* [mansion or palace] with a gable of similar design. See: Willem B Bollée, “The *kūṭāgāra* or from men’s house to mansion in Eastern India and South-East Asia,” in *Shastric Traditions in Indian Arts*, (eds) Anna Libera Dallapiccola, Christine Walter-Mendy and Stephanie Zingel-Avé Lallemand, vol 1, texts pp 143-149; XXXVI-XLI, Stuttgart: Steiner Verlag Wiesbaden GMBH, 1989.

§41 *nivātaṃ*

Bo “shut off”; IBH “protected from the wind.” §41 The various words for kinds of furnishings are more accurately rendered by IBH, but more readable in Bo.

§42 *pokkharāṇī*

Bo “pond”; IBH “lotus pool.” [*Pokkharāṇī* (nt) comes from *pokkhara* (Skt *puṣkara*, “lotus” (SED), literally meaning, “lotus-like; full of lotuses.”) It is a man-made pond or lake, usually small. See PED sv.]

§44 *abhijānāmi . . . caritā*

Bo “I recall having lived” is more accurate than Kh “I have had direct knowledge of “I...as one who has lived it” or IBH “I . . . , as one who fares, fully know.”

§44 *tapassī homi (parama-tapassī)*

IBH “I became an ascetic” is better than Bo “I have practised asceticism”

§44 *lukho*

Bo “coarseness”; IBH “loathly.”

§44 *jegucchī*

Bo “scrupulousness” is better than IBH “a detester.” The meaning must be “one who seeks or desires to guard (living beings from harm),” that is, desiderative noun from √GUP [to protect]. Here and below (*jegucchismī*), it refers to a person behaving in a particular way rather than to a person’s practice.

§45 *me idaṃ . . . tapassitāya*

Bo “Such was my asceticism...”; IBH “there was this for me through asceticism” (parallels show the case to be locative). Literally, “I had been following by way of asceticism.”

§45 has a long list of ascetic practices. IBH is often better than Kh. Bo usually follows Kh with only a few exceptions, apart from a missing sentence.

§47 *yāva uda,bindumhi pi me dayā paccupaṭṭhitā hoti*

Bo “I was full of pity even for [the beings in] a drop of water”; Kh omits the words between square brackets; IBH “there was set up in me kindness even towards a drop of water.” I think Bo is probably wrong here and the Commentary right to suppose that it is a question of where one lets water drops fall rather than of beings in a water drop. Literally, “(I was mindful while going back and forth) to such an extent that my pity was manifested even in the case of a drop of water.”

§48 *pavivittasmī*

Bo “seclusion”; IBH “aloofness.” Literally, “this was my (behavior) as a solitary.” All of these (from §46 to §51) literally refers to people rather than to their practices.

§52 *oṭṭha,paḍaṃ*

Bo “camel’s hoof”; IBH “bullock’s hoof.” Probably, here, *oṭṭha* means “buffalo” as in Vedic rather than “camel” as in Classical Sanskrit; cf CPD.

§52 *go,pānasiyo olugga,viluggā*

Bo “jutting out as gaunt as the crazy rafters”; IBH “my gaunt (ribs) became like the crazy rafters.” CPD has “broken down, collapsed” for the second word. Neither “gaunt” nor “crazy” seem appropriate here.

§52 *akkhi,tārakā*

Bo “gleam of water,” but IBH “sparkles of water” is better. CPD has: “a sparkling bubble,” following a gp. [This last note is untraceable]. CPD 1:13 says “Skt *akṣi-tārā*, ‘the pupil of the eye,’ M 1:81,17 = 245,36; MA 2:66,17; DhA 190,32.” Both DP & PED define it as “the pupil of the eye”. PED defines *tārakā* as “(fig) sparkling, glitter, twinkle,” as in *udaka,tārakā*, “sparkling of the water” (M 1:80.)

§52 The penultimate sentence is missing in Bo, but not Kh.

§53 Bo always substitutes “brahmins” for Kh “divines.”

§60 *yaññena*

Bo “sacrifice” is better than IBH “oblation.”

§62 *niddā,kilamatha,paṭivinodanā*

Bo “rest in order to remove sleepiness and tiredness” seems to introduce unnecessary complication; cp IBH “dispelling fatigue by sleep.”

§62 *pañha,paṭibhānaṃ*

Bo “replies to questions”; IBH “ways of putting questions.” Bo’s translation follows Buddhaghosa’s *pañha,vyākaraṇaṃ*. This perhaps slightly misunderstands him. *Paṭibhāna* (cf BHSD) refers to readiness in speech, quick-wittedness, inspiration. Of course, as Buddhaghosa indicates, this could manifest here precisely in the manner of replying.

§63 *lokānukampāya*

Bo “out of compassion for the world” = IBH; Kh has “pity.” It is regrettable that both Bodhi and Miss Horner have rendered both *anukampā* and *karuṇā* by the same English word; this obscures some important differences in usage.

— — —

The Greater Discourse on the Lion-roar

M 12

[68] 1 Thus have I heard.

Sunakkhatta’s accusations

1.2 At one time, the Blessed One was staying in the thick woods outside the city of Vesālī to the west.⁷⁹

2 Now, at that time, the young Licchavī Sunakkhatta,⁸⁰ had recently left this Dharma-Vinaya. He said this before a crowd⁸¹ in Vesālī,

2.2 “The recluse Gotama has neither the superhuman state⁸² nor the distinction in knowledge and vision⁸³ worthy of the noble ones!⁸⁴

⁷⁹ “To the west,” Ce Ee Comy *avara,pure* (lit, “west of the city”), Be Se *apara,pure*. Comy glosses as “to the west of the city” (*purassa avare*), and adds that it is unlike Amba,pālī’s grove, which is inside Vesālī, but like Jīvaka’s mango grove, which is outside it (MA 2:21). According to **Loma.hamsa J** (J 94), the Buddha is said to be staying in Pāṭik’ārāma, which depends on Vesālī for alms (J 1:389).

⁸⁰ “The young Licchavī,” *licchavī,putta*, lit “son of a Licchavī,” so called because he is the son of a Licchavī rajah (MA 2:21). On the use of the suffix *-putta*, see V:H 2:xliv ff.

⁸¹ “Before a crowd,” *parisatiṃ*, loc of *parisa*.

⁸² The superhuman states (*uttari manussa,dhamma*) are qualities and attainments beyond those of an ordinary human, comprising the 10 wholesome courses of action (M 9,6/1:47; elaborated at M 41,12-14/1:287 f). They also include the dhyanas (*jhāna*), the 3 direct knowledges (*abhiññā*), and the paths and fruitions (*magga,phala*), ie, the various levels of awakening. These states are subject of Pār 4 (V 3:87-109, def at 92); also M 1:246.

⁸³ “Knowledge and insight” (*ñāṇa,dassana*): Comy broadly defs them as “the divine eye (knowledge of how others fare according to their karma), insight, the path, the fruits, review knowledge, and omniscience” (*dubba,cakkhum pi vipassanā pi maggo pi phalam pi paccavekkhaṇa,ñāṇam pi sabb-ññūta,ñāṇam pu vuiccati*, MA 2:21).

⁸⁴ *N’atthi samaṇassa gotamassa uttari manussa,dhammā alam-ariya,ñāṇa,dassana,viseso*. “Any distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones” (*alam ariya,ñāṇa,dassana,visesa*) is stock signifying all higher degrees of meditative knowledge characteristic of the noble saint. Comy says that here it specifically refers to the supramundane path (*lok’uttara magga*) that Sunakkhatta claims the Buddha lacks (MA 2:21 f). The first part—that the recluse Gotama has not attained any superhuman state—recurs in a Skt fragment related to the 10 powers (SHT

2.3 The recluse Gotama teaches a Dharma following an inquiry based on his own wits, fabricated by reasoning.⁸⁵ The Dharma that is taught is only for some purpose,⁸⁶ that of leading out for the complete destruction of suffering.⁸⁷

Sāriputta reports to the Buddha

3 Then, the venerable Sāriputta, having dressed early in the morning, taking bowl and robe, entered Vesālī for almsfood.

3.2 Then, the venerable Sāriputta heard the young Licchavī Sunakkhatta speaking this before a crowd in Vesālī,

3.3 “*The recluse Gotama has neither the superhuman state nor the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!*

The recluse Gotama teaches a Dharma following an inquiry based on his own wits, fabricated by reasoning. The Dharma that he teaches only for the purpose of the complete destruction of suffering.”

3.4 Then, the venerable Sāriputta, having walked on almsround, having taken his meal of almsfood, approached the Blessed One, saluted him, and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the venerable Sāriputta said this to the Blessed One:

3.5 “Bhante, the young Licchavī Sunakkhatta, who had recently left this Dharma-Vinaya, said this before a crowd in Vesālī,

‘*The recluse Gotama has neither the superhuman state nor the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!*

The recluse Gotama teaches a Dharma following an inquiry based on his own wits, fabricated by reasoning. The Dharma that he teaches only for the purpose of the complete destruction of suffering.”

The Buddha responds

4 “For, Sāriputta, this Sunakkhatta is a hollow man⁸⁸ who is angry. For these are words of one who is angry.

4.2 Sāriputta, this hollow man Sunakkhatta, thinking, ‘I will speak of blame,’ in fact, speaks in praise of the Tathagata [69].

For, Sāriputta, those who speak in praise of the Tathagata, would speak thus,

‘The Dharma that he teaches is only for the purpose of the complete destruction of suffering.’⁸⁹

1:18 V2-3, p11): *n-ās[t]i śramaṇasya (g)[au](tama)sy-ottaraṃ, manuṣya, dharmmād-iti*. On the expression *uttari, -manussa, dhamma*, see also Analayo, “Uttarimanussadhamma,” in *Ency Bsm* 8, 2008:462-465.

⁸⁵ *Takka, pariyāhataṃ samaṇo gotamo dhammaṃ deseti vīmaṃsā ’nucaritaṃ sayam, paṭibhānaṃ*.

⁸⁶ Comy explains “that is taught is only for some purpose” (*yassa ca khvāssa atthāya*) as follows: meditation on foulness for the purpose of countering lust, the cultivation of lovingkindness for countering hatred, the 5 ways for countering delusion [viz, learning, listening, remembering, familiarizing with, and wisely attending to the profound understanding of the 5 aggregates, etc (*gambhīra, ñāṇa, cariya, bhūtānaṃ khandh’ādīnaṃ uggahāṇa, savana, dhāraṇa, paricaya, yoniso, manasikāre sandhāy’āha*, DAṬ:Be 2:16], and mindfulness of the breath for removing thoughts (MA 2:22).

⁸⁷ *Yassa ca khvāssa atthāya dhammo desito so niyyāti tak, karassa sammā dukkha-k, khayāyāti*. Sunakkhatta is saying that the Buddha has merely thought out his teachings rather than actually realized them through insight wisdom: said of a “reasoner” or an “inquirer” (one without direct experience of true reality, but merely speculates) in **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1,34+49+57+69), SD 25, and **Sandaka S** (M 76,27) + SD 35.7 (3.1.3). Apparently, to him, having psychic powers is superior to the complete destruction of suffering (a view commonly held by God-believers even today). See (3.3.1).

⁸⁸ “Holy man,” *mogha, purisa*, lit “empty person.” *Mogha* evokes a sense of a serious spiritual lack. As such, the tr, “misguided,” although close, only reflects a psychosocial errancy. Cf T S Eliot’s “Hollow Men,” where “empty men” is also mentioned) which fully brings out the meaning here but lacks emotional connection for those unfamiliar with the poem. See **Udumbarikā Sīha, nāda S** (D 25,24.2/3:56), SD 1.4; **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22,6), SD 3.13.

⁸⁹ *Yassa ca khvāssa atthāya dhammo desito so niyyāti tak, karassa sammā dukkha-k, khayāyāti*.

5 Indeed, Sāriputta, for this hollow man Sunakkhatta, there is such drift [inference] of the Dharma about me, thus,

‘So, too, is he the Blessed One:⁹⁰ for, he is arhat, self-awakened one, accomplished in wisdom and conduct, well-farer, knower of worlds, peerless guide of persons to be tamed, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.’

The 3 powers⁹¹

6 (1)⁹²THE MANIFOLD PSYCHIC POWERS. Indeed, Sāriputta, for this hollow man Sunakkhatta, there is such drift [inference] of the Dharma about me, thus,

‘So, too, does the Blessed One enjoy **the manifold psychic powers**, thus:⁹³

- (1) Having been one, he becomes many; having been many, he becomes one.
- (2) He appears, and disappears.
- (3) He goes unhindered through walls, through ramparts, and through mountains as if through space.
- (4) He dives in and out of the earth as if it were water.
- (5) He walks on water without sinking as if it were earth.
- (6) Sitting cross-legged, he goes through the air like a winged bird.
- (7) With his hand he touches and strokes even the sun and the moon, so mighty, so powerful.
- (8) He has power over his body up to as far as the Brahma world.

7 (2) THE DIVINE EAR (CLAIRAUDIENCE). Indeed, Sāriputta, for this hollow man Sunakkhatta, there is such drift [inference] of the Dharma about me, thus,

‘So, too, does the Blessed One enjoy **the divine-ear element**,⁹⁴ purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.’⁹⁵

8 (3) MIND-READING. Indeed, Sāriputta, for this hollow man Sunakkhatta, there is such drift [inference] of the Dharma about me, thus,

‘So, too, does the Blessed One know the minds of other beings, other individuals, having fully grasped them with his own mind,⁹⁶

he knows [understands] a mind with lust as a mind with	lust,
and a mind without lust as a mind without	lust.
He knows a mind with aversion as a mind with	aversion,
and a mind without aversion as a mind without	aversion.
He knows a mind with delusion as a mind	with delusion,
and a mind without delusion as a mind	without delusion.
He knows a contracted mind [due to sloth and torpor] as	a contracted mind,
and a distracted mind [due to restlessness and remorse] as	a distracted mind.
He knows an exalted mind [through dhyana]	as an exalted mind,

⁹⁰ For details on this verse, see *Buddhānussati*, SD 15.7.

⁹¹ See (3.4).

⁹² From hereon, the rest of the Sutta is a grand rebuttal of Sunakkhatta’s criticisms of the Buddha’s powers and spirituality. The first 3 of the 6 superknowledges (*abhiññā*) are covered in §§6-8; the last 3 are the last of the 10 tathagata powers. Comy says that the latter should be understood as the powers of knowledge (*ñāṇa, bala*) that are attained by all buddhas as the fruit of their accumulation of merit. **Vibhaṅga** (ch 16) gives an elaborate analysis of these powers, according to the Abhidhamma (Vbh §§809-831/440-451).

⁹³ *Iti’pi so bhagavā aneka, vihitam iddhi, vidham paccanubhoti*. This whole passage on the manifold psychic powers, as in **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,89), SD 8.10.

⁹⁴ “Divine-ear element,” *dibba, sota, dhātu*, clairaudience. See **Miracles**, SD 27.5a (5.2).

⁹⁵ A more detailed version of description of the divine ear is found in **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,91), SD 8.10.

⁹⁶ See [6]. The foll section (italicized) is a list of mental states, apparently taken from **Satipaṭṭhāna Ss** (D 22,12-1/2:299 = M 10,34/1:59), where it fits more appropriately (Walshe, D:W 546 n131). For another def of mind-reading (4 kinds), see **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28,6/3:103 f), SD 14.10. A slightly more detailed description is at **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,93), SD 8.10.

and an unexalted mind [not developed by dhyana] as
 He knows a surpassable mind as
 and an unsurpassable mind as
 He knows a concentrated mind as
 and an unconcentrated mind as
 He knows a freed mind as
 and an unfreed mind as

an unexalted mind.
 a surpassable mind,
 an unsurpassable mind⁹⁷.
 a concentrated mind,
 an unconcentrated mind.
 a freed mind,
 an unfreed mind.’

The Buddha’s 10 powers

9 Now, here, Sāriputta, there are these **10 tathagata-powers** of the Tathagata, the power by which he claims the place of the herd-leader [the bull],⁹⁸ roars the lion-roar⁹⁹ before assemblies, turns the divine [perfect] wheel.¹⁰⁰ What are the ten?¹⁰¹

10 (1) Here, Sāriputta, the Tathagata understands, as it really is, what is possible to be possible, and what is impossible to be impossible.¹⁰²

10.2 Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *the Tathagata understands, as it really is, what is possible to be possible, and what is impossible to be impossible—*

this, Sāriputta, [70] is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

11 (2) Furthermore, Sāriputta, the Tathagata understands, according to true reality, the creation of karma, past, present and future, both in terms of cause and result.¹⁰³

11.2 Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *the Tathagata understands, according to true reality, the creation of karma, past, present and future, both in terms of cause and result—*

⁹⁷ Unsurpassable (*anuttaram*) mind, probably synonymous with “developed” mind. See D:W 592 n667.

⁹⁸ “The herd-leader” (*āsabha*) (adj, “bull-like, lordly”), the leading bull, the leader. Comy glosses as “the state of excellence and the best,” *seṭṭha-t, thānam uttama-t, thānam*, MA 2:26). The word “bellwether” (leading sheep, with a bell around its neck) also applies here, although it is usu used in English writing in a contemptuous sense for a mob or rebel leader.

⁹⁹ On the Buddha’s making his lion-roar, see (**Anicca**) **Sīha S** (S 22.78/3:84-86), SD 42.10.

¹⁰⁰ *Dasa kho pan’imāni, sāriputta, tathāgatassa tathāgata, balāni yehi balehi samānnāgato tathāgato āsabham thānam paṭijānāti, parisāsu sīha, nādam nadati, brahma, cakkaṃ pavatteti*. “Turns the divine wheel,” *brahma, cakkaṃ pavatteti*, where *pavatteti* is caus, so we lit have, “he sets the wheel rolling,” and so on. It is here rendered idiomatically. Comy explains that the “divine wheel” (*brahma, cakka*) is the supreme, best, most excellent wheel, the wheel of truth (*dhmma, cakka*) in its twofold meanings: the knowledge that penetrates the truth (*paṭivedha nāṇa*) and the knowledge of how to expound the teaching (*desanā nāṇa*) (MA 2:27 f). AA adds that former is supramundane (*lok’uttara*) and the latter mundane (*lokiya*). Both knowledges together, however, are unique to the Buddha (AA 5:12; also at 3.9, with refs to various usages of *brahma, cakka*, also at MA 2:27). The phrase ending with the symbol of the divine wheel (*brahma, cakka*) recurs in **Dasa, bala S 1 + 2** (S 12.21+22), where it is def as the reflection on the 5 aggregates in terms of the 4 truths; in **Vesārajja S** (A 4.8), where the divine wheel is mentioned in connection with the fourfold intrepidity of the Buddha. Also in **Ananussuta S** (A 5.11/3:9), **Sīha, nāda S** (A 6.64/3:417-421).

¹⁰¹ These 10 powers are given in (**Dasaka**) **Sīha S** (A 10.21/5:32 f), SD 81.2; summarized at Pm 2:174-176; elaborated at Vbh 30-831, briefly at 317 f. See §6 n (header) above.

¹⁰² *Idha sāriputta tathāgato thānaṃ ca thānato aṭṭhānaṃ ca aṭṭhānato yathā, bhūtaṃ pajānāti*. Vbh 809 explains this knowledge by qu **Bahu, dhātuka S** (M 115, 12-17), SD 29.1a; see also Vbh 400; Dhs 1337. Comy, however, explains it in the Abhidhamma sense, as the knowledge of the correlations btw causes and their results (MA 2:28). This is the only place in M where this quality is mentioned. However, it is mentioned in **Thāna S** (S 52.15/5:304); (**Chakka**) **Sīha, nāda S** (A 6.64/3:417+419+ 420); (**Dasaka**) **Sīha, nāda S** (A 10.21/5:33); **Adhivuttipada S** (A 10.22/5:37); It 123*; Ap 2:460; Pm 2:174, 175, 176.

¹⁰³ *Puna ca param sāriputta tathāgato atītānāgata, paccuppannānaṃ kamma, samādānānaṃ thānaso hetuso vipākam yathā, bhūtaṃ pajānāti*. **Vibhaṅga** explains that the Buddha understands that beings are of inferior inclinations and superior inclinations, and that they tend to flock with those with similar inclinations (Vbh 813/340 f).

this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

12 (3) Furthermore, Sāriputta, the Tathagata understands the ways leading to the destinies [goals].¹⁰⁴

12.2 Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *the Tathagata understands the ways leading to the destinies [goals]*—
this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

13 (4) Furthermore, Sāriputta, the Tathagata understands, according to true reality, the numerous and different elements and worlds.¹⁰⁵

Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *the Tathagata understands, according to true reality, the numerous and different elements and world*—

this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

14 (5) Furthermore, Sāriputta, the Tathāgata understands the various dispositions of beings.¹⁰⁶

14.2 Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *the Tathagata understands the various dispositions of beings*—
this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

15 (6) Furthermore, Sāriputta, the Tathāgata understands, according to true reality, the faculties, here and beyond, of other beings, other individuals.¹⁰⁷

15.2 Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *the Tathagata understands, according to true reality, the faculties, here and beyond, of other beings, other individuals*—

this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

16 (7) Furthermore, Sāriputta, the Tathāgata understands the defilement, the cleansing, and the emergence regarding the attainments, the liberations, the samadhis and the dhyanas.¹⁰⁸

Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *the Tathāgata understands the defilement, the cleansing, and the emergence regarding the attainment, the liberation, the samadhis and the dhyanas*—

this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

17 (8) “Furthermore, Sāriputta, the Tathagata recollects his manifold past lives, that is,

1 birth, 2 births, 3 births, 4, 5,

10, 20, 30, 40, 50,

100, 10,000, 100,000,

many aeons of cosmic contractions, many aeons of cosmic expansions,

many aeons of cosmic contractions and expansions, (recollecting,)

17.2 ‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

¹⁰⁴ *Puna caparam, sārīputta, tathāgato sabbattha, gāminim paṭipadam yathā, bhūtam pajānāti.*

¹⁰⁵ *Puna ca, param sārīputta tathāgato aneka, dhātu, nānā, dhātu, lokam yathā, bhūtam pajānāti.* The “elements” (*dhātu*) here are the 5 aggregates (*khandha*), the 6 sense-bases (*āyatana*), and the 18 elements (*dhātu*) = 6 sense-bases + 6 sense-consciousnesses + 6 sense-contacts (MA 2:29).

¹⁰⁶ *Puna ca, param sārīputta tathāgato sattānam nānā’ dhiṃmutti, katham yathā, bhūtam pajānāti.* *Adhimutti*, “resolve, intention, disposition, inclination” (D 1:174 as *adhivimutti*; A 6:36; It 70 :: ItA 65; UA 194; Miln 161, 169; Vbh 340, 341; DA 1:44, 103; MA 1:124).

¹⁰⁷ Comy explains this as the knowledge of the inferiority and superiority of beings in terms of the 5 faculties (*pañc’indriya*), viz, faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration and wisdom (MA 2:29 f). **Vibhaṅga** explains this in some detail (Vbh §814-827/340-342).

¹⁰⁸ *Puna ca, param sārīputta tathāgato jhāna, vimokkha, samādhi, samāpattīnam saṅkilesam vodānam vuṭṭhānam yathā, bhūtam pajānāti.* **Vibhaṅga** explains defilement (*saṅkilesa*) as a state bringing about decline, cleansing (*vodāna*) a state bringing about excellence, and emergence (*vuṭṭhāna*) as both cleansing and rising out of an attainment (Vbh §828/342). There are 9 attainments (*samāpatti*), viz, the 4 dhyanas, 4 formless attainments, and the cessation of perception and feeling, as in **Nivāpa S** (M 25, 12-20), SD 61.2. The 8 liberations (*vimokkha*) in listed in **Sakul’-udāyī S** (M 77, 22), SD 49.5, & **Sal-āyatana Vibhaṅga S** (M 137, 26), SD 29.5.

Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there.

There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

Thus, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.

17.3 Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *the Tathagata recollects his manifold past lives, that is,*

1 birth, 2 births, 3 births, 4, 5,

10, 20, 30, 40, 50,

100, 10,000, 100,000,

many aeons of cosmic contractions, many aeons of cosmic expansions,

many aeons of cosmic contractions and expansions, (recollecting,)

17.2 ‘*There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.*

Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there.

There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

Thus, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details—

this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

18 (9) Furthermore, Sāriputta, by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance],¹⁰⁹

purified and surpassing the human, the Tathāgata sees beings passing away and reappearing,

and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate,

faring according to their karma, thus:

18.2 THE HELL REFRAIN¹¹⁰ ‘These beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—

with the body’s breaking up, after death, [71] have reappeared in a state of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

18.3 But these beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—with the body’s breaking up, after death, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

Thus, by means of the divine eye, he sees beings passing away and reappearing, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, faring according to their karma.

18.4 Inasmuch, Sāriputta, as *by means of the divine eye* [clairvoyance],

purified and surpassing the human, the Tathāgata sees beings passing away and reappearing,

and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate,

faring according to their karma, thus:

18.5 ‘*These beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views, and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—*

with the body’s breaking up, after death,

have reappeared in a state of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

18.6 *But these beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—with the body’s breaking up, after death,*

¹⁰⁹ *Dibba, cakkhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhamma, cakkhu*), which is a term for streamwinning.

¹¹⁰ See (3.3.2).

have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

*Thus, by means of the divine eye, he sees beings passing away and reappearing,
and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate,
faring according to their karma—*

*this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of
the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.*

19 (10) Furthermore, Sāriputta, by having realized for himself by direct knowledge, the Tathāgata,
right here and now, attains and dwells in the freedom of mind and the freedom by wisdom¹¹¹
that are influx-free, with the destruction of the mental influxes.¹¹²

19.2 Inasmuch, Sāriputta, *by having realized for himself by direct knowledge, the Tathāgata,
right here and now, attains and dwells in the freedom of mind and the freedom by wisdom
that are influx-free, with the destruction of the mental influxes—*

this, too, Sāriputta, is the tathagata-power of the Tathagata, by virtue of which he claims the place of
the herd-leader, roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

20 These, Sāriputta, are the 10 tathagata-powers of the Tathagata, the power by which he claims the
place of the herd-leader [a bull], roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

21 THE HELL REFRAIN. Sāriputta, inasmuch as I know thus, see thus, if anyone were to say thus,¹¹³
*‘The recluse Gotama has neither the superhuman state nor the distinction in knowledge and vision
worthy of the noble ones!’*

*The recluse Gotama teaches a Dharma following an inquiry based on his own wits, fabricated by rea-
soning’—*

if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not give up such a
view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.¹¹⁴

21.2 Sāriputta, just as a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished
in wisdom, will here and now attain final knowledge,
even so, Sāriputta, I say that such is the result¹¹⁵—

¹¹¹ “Freedom of mind (*ceto, vimutti*) ... freedom by wisdom (*paññā, vimutti*).” Freedom of mind is so called because the mind is freed, by way of concentration, from lust. Freedom by wisdom is so called because the mind is freed, normally through insight, from ignorance. When they are coupled and described as influx-free (*anāsava*), they jointly result from the destruction of the mental influxes by the supramundane path of arhathood.

¹¹² The term *āsava* (lit “inflow, outflow”) comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously tr as “taints” (“deadly taints,” RD), “canker, corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, bad (influence),” or simply left untr. The Abhidhamma lists 4 influxes (*āsava*), ie, those of (1) sense-desire (*kām’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav’āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh’āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These 4 are also known as “floods” (*ogha*) and “yokes” (*yoga*). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) [43] is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsavas* is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict under *āsava*.

¹¹³ *Yo kho maṇi, sāriputta, evaṃ jānantam evaṃ passantam evaṃ vadeyya.*

¹¹⁴ *Taṃ sāriputta vācam appahāya taṃ cittaṃ appahāya taṃ diṭṭhiṃ appaṇissajjitvā yathā, bhatam nikkhitto evaṃ niraye.* The phrase *yathā, bhatam nikkhitto evaṃ niraye* is stock (M 1:71; S 4:325; A 1:8, 96, 105, 292, 297, 2:71, 83; It 12, 14, 26; ItA 72, tr ItA:M 181). Comy glosses: “He will be cast into hell as if carried off and put there by the wardens of hell.” (MA 2:32). *Yathābhatam* = *yathā* (“just as”) + *ābhatam* (“brought, carried, conveyed,” often interchanged with *ahaṭam* or *agataṃ*): CPD *ābhata*. *Yathā* here entails a figure of speech, as reflected in the tr. Alt tr “according to his desserts he will be, as it were, dropped off in hell” (S:B 1346::S 42.9/4:325). Ñāṇamoli: “Although such a fate may sound excessively severe merely for verbal denigration, it should be remembered that he is maligning a Fully Awakened Buddha with a mind of hatred, with the intention of discouraging others from entering upon the path that could lead them to complete liberation from suffering.” (*The Lion’s Roar: Two Discourses of the Buddha* (WH 390/391), rev ed Bodhi, 1993 n17). Note the conditional *yathā*, “just as if,” which suggests that the hell-states referred to here are not actual places, but a state of mind, where the sufferings are just as real. For scholars’ discussions: It:M 19 n58. See *Pātāla S* (S 36.4), SD 2.25.

¹¹⁵ *Evaṃ sampadam idam, sāriputta, vadāmi.* Here, *sampadā* means “result, consequence.”

that if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not relinquish such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

The Buddha's 4 intrepidities

22 Sāriputta, there are these **4 intrepidities**¹¹⁶ of the Tathagata, accomplished in which he claims the place of the herd-leader [a bull], roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.¹¹⁷ What are the four?

23 (1) 'Here, I see no ground on which any recluse or brahmin or deva or Māra or Brahmā or anyone else in the world [72] could, with justice, accuse me thus:

"While you claim to be fully awakened, you are not fully awakened about these things."¹¹⁸

Seeing that I abide in no ground, Sāriputta, accomplished in security, accomplished in fearlessness, accomplished in intrepidity.'

24 (2) 'Here, I see no ground on which any recluse or brahmin or deva or Māra or Brahmā or anyone else in the world could, with justice, accuse me thus:

"While you claim to have destroyed the mental influxes, you have not (really) destroyed them."¹¹⁹

Seeing that I abide in no ground, Sāriputta, accomplished in security, accomplished in fearlessness, accomplished in intrepidity.'

25 (3) 'Here, I see no ground on which any recluse or brahmin or deva or Māra or Brahmā or anyone else in the world could, with justice, accuse me thus:

"These things you call obstructions are unable to obstruct (the spiritual progress of) one who engages in them."¹²⁰

Seeing that I abide in no ground, Sāriputta, accomplished in security, accomplished in fearlessness, accomplished in intrepidity.'

26 (4) 'Here, I see no ground on which any recluse or brahmin or deva or Māra or Brahmā or anyone else in the world could, with justice, accuse me thus:

"When he teaches the Dharma to someone for the sake of the spiritual goal, when he works on it, it would not lead him to the complete ending of suffering."¹²¹

Seeing that I abide in no ground, Sāriputta, accomplished in security, accomplished in fearlessness, accomplished in intrepidity.'

27 These, Sāriputta, are the 4 kinds of tathagata's intrepidity of the Tathagata, accomplished in which he claims the place of the herd-leader [a bull], roars the lion-roar before assemblies, turns the divine wheel.

28 THE HELL REFRAIN. Sāriputta, inasmuch as I know thus, see thus, if anyone were to say thus, 'The recluse Gotama has neither the superhuman state nor the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!

¹¹⁶ "Intrepidities" (*vesārajjāni*), 4 kinds of "moral or spiritual courage or confidence": see **Sarabha S** (A 3.64/-1:186) & **Vesārajja S** (A 4.8/2:8); also **Ambatṭha S** (D 3.2.22/1:110); **Upāli S** (M 56,18/1:380); **Cara S** (A 4.11/-2:13 = It 110/115-118); **Nakula S** (A 6.16/3:297 f); **Arakheyye S** (A 7.58/4:83), (**Vesālika**) **Ugga S** (A 8.21/4:210), (**Haṭṭhi,gāmaka**) **Ugga S** (A 8.22/4:213); Pm 2:194; Nc 466; DA 1:278; KhpA 104; VvA 213; J 2:27; DhA 1:86. **Sārajja S** (A 5.101) mentions these 5 conditions for moral courage, viz, faith, moral virtue, deep learning, industry, and wisdom, SD 28.9a (3); also **Piṇḍolya S** (S 22.80/3:91-94), SD 28.9a.

¹¹⁷ *Cattār'imāni sārīputta tathāgatassa vesārajjāni yehi vesārajjeḥi samannāgato tathāgato āsabhaṃ ṭhānaṃ paṭijānāti, parisāsu sīhanādaṃ nadati, brahma,cakkaṃ pavatteti.* The basic structure parallels that of the refrain in §9 [qv] etc.

¹¹⁸ *Sammā,sambuddhassa te paṭijānato ime dhammā anabhisambuddhā'ti.*

¹¹⁹ *Khīṇ'āsavassa te paṭijānato ime āsavā aparikkhīṇā'ti.*

¹²⁰ *Ye kho pana te antarāyikā dhammā vuttā, te paṭisevato nālaṃ antarāyāyā'ti.* Comy says that sexual intercourse (*methuna,dhamma*) is meant here (MA 2:33). Cf Pāc 68 (V 4:135,18-30); see V:H 3:21 n5.

¹²¹ *Yassa kho pana te atthāya dhammo desito, so na niyyāti tak,karassa sammā dukkha-k,khayāyāti.*

The recluse Gotama teaches a Dharma following an inquiry based on his own wits, fabricated by reasoning’—

if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not give up such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

28.2 *Sāriputta, just as a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, would here and now attain final knowledge,*

even so, Sāriputta, I say that such is the result—

that if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not relinquish such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

The 8 assemblies

29 Sāriputta, there are these **8 companies** (*aṭṭha parisa*). What are the eight?¹²²

- | | |
|---|---------------------------------|
| (1) The company of kshatriyas [nobles], | <i>khattiya,parisā</i> |
| (2) the company of brahmins [the priestly class], | <i>brāhmaṇa,parisā</i> |
| (3) the company of houselords, | <i>gaha,pati,parisā</i> |
| (4) the company of recluses, | <i>samaṇa,parisā</i> |
| (5) the company of the 4 great divine kings, | <i>cātum.mahā.rājika,parisā</i> |
| (6) the company of the gods of the 33, | <i>tāvatiṃsa,parisā</i> |
| (7) the company of Māra, ¹²³ and | <i>māra,parisā</i> |
| (8) the company of Brahmā. | <i>brahma,parisā</i> |

These, Sāriputta, are the 8 companies.

29.2 Accomplished in these 4 kinds of intrepidity, Sāriputta, the Tathagata approaches and enters these 8 kinds of companies.

30 (1) Sāriputta, I recall having approached many hundreds of companies of kshatriyas,¹²⁴ and when I was there, even before sitting down, before conversing, before discussing, and before engaging (with them),¹²⁵

indeed, Sāriputta, I see no ground¹²⁶ whatsoever that any fear or timidity would overcome me there.¹²⁷

30.2 *Sāriputta, I recall having approached many hundreds of companies of brahmins, and when I was there, even before sitting down, before conversing, before discussing, and before engaging (with them),*

indeed, Sāriputta, I see no ground whatsoever that any fear or timidity would overcome me there.

30.3 *Sāriputta, I recall having approached many hundreds of companies of houselords, and when I was there, even before sitting down, before conversing, before discussing, and before engaging (with them),*

indeed, Sāriputta, I see no ground whatsoever that any fear or timidity would overcome me there.

30.4 *Sāriputta, I recall having approached many hundreds of companies of recluses, and when I was there, even before sitting down, before conversing, before discussing, and before engaging (with them),*

indeed, Sāriputta, I see no ground whatsoever that any fear or timidity would overcome me there.

30.5 *Sāriputta, I recall having approached many hundreds of companies of the 4 great divine kings,*

¹²² For an evidently older listing, see **Dhammaññū S** (A 7.64,9/4:116), SD 30.10. Recurs in **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 19,3.21-23/2:109 f), SD 9; also (**Aṭṭha**) **Parisā S** (A 8.69/4:307 f).

¹²³ Comy notes that *māra* is here singular, not plural (*na mārānaṃ*) (MA 2:34). Further, see n below ad loc.

¹²⁴ Comy gives the examples of the company around king Bimbisāra, around his own relations (the Sakyas), those of the Licchavīs, and so on (MA 3:34). See D:RD 2:117 n.

¹²⁵ *Tatra’pi mayā sannisinna,pubbañ c’eva, sallapita,pubbañ ca, sākacchā ca samāpajjita,pubbā.*

¹²⁶ “Ground,” *nimitta* (lit “sign”), ie, either a person (*puggala*), or a condition, tradition, teaching (*dhamma*) (MA 2:35). Here, we can take *dhamma* as referring to whatever is not represented by *puggala*.

¹²⁷ *Tatra vata maṃ bhayaṃ vā sārājjaṃ vā okkamissatīti nimittam etaṃ, sāriputta na samanupassāmi.*

and when I was there, even before sitting down, before conversing, before discussing, and before engaging (with them),

indeed, Sāriputta, I see no ground whatsoever that any fear or timidity would overcome me there.

30.6 Sāriputta, I recall having approached many hundreds of companies of the gods of the 33, and when I was there, even before sitting down, before conversing, before discussing, and before engaging (with them),

indeed, Sāriputta, I see no ground whatsoever that any fear or timidity would overcome me there.

30.7 Sāriputta, I recall having approached many hundreds of companies of Māra,¹²⁸ and when I was there, even before sitting down, before conversing, before discussing, and before engaging (with them),

indeed, Sāriputta, I see no ground whatsoever that any fear or timidity would overcome me there.

30.8 Sāriputta, I recall having approached many hundreds of companies of Brahmā, and when I was there, even before sitting down, before conversing, before discussing, and before engaging (with them),

indeed, Sāriputta, I see no ground whatsoever that any fear or [73] timidity would overcome me there.

31 THE HELL REFRAIN. Sāriputta, inasmuch as I know thus, see thus, if anyone were to say thus, ‘The recluse Gotama has neither the superhuman state nor the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!

The recluse Gotama teaches a Dharma following an inquiry based on his own wits, fabricated by reasoning’—

if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not give up such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

31.2 Sāriputta, just as a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, will here and now attain final knowledge,

even so, Sāriputta, I say that such is the result—

that if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not relinquish such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

The 4 kinds of birth

32 Sāriputta, there are these **4 kinds of birth** (*yoni*). What are the four?¹²⁹

- | | |
|---------------------------------------|-------------------------|
| (1) The egg-born [oviparous] birth, | <i>aṇḍa, jā yoni</i> |
| (2) The womb-born [viviparous] birth, | <i>jalābu, jā yoni</i> |
| (3) The moisture-born birth, | <i>saṃseda, jā yoni</i> |
| (4) The spontaneous birth. | <i>opapātikā yoni</i> |

33 And what, Sāriputta, is **the egg-born birth**?

There are, Sāriputta, these beings born by breaking out of the egg-shell¹³⁰—this is called the egg-born birth.

¹²⁸ Comy states that this is “not (companies) of Māras, but an occasion when those in Māra’s retinue gather” (MA 2:34). In other words, just as there is only Buddha in a world-system, there is only *one* Māra (his antithesis, as it were) for it.

¹²⁹ As at **Saṅgīti S** (D 33, 1.11(36)/3:230). Comy explains that devas of the 4 great kings and higher all arise spontaneously. Earth devas, however, are of the 4 kinds of birth [which curiously means they are also “moisture-born”!] Some humans, too, arise spontaneously, but for the most part are womb-born. Egg-born humans include the two Kōṇḍaputta (or Kōṇḍaputta) elders who are brothers [cf VA 1:52]. Those moisture-born, meaning “lotus-born” (*paduma gabbhe nibbatta*) include the brahmin Pokkhara, sāti and queen Padumā, vatī. The lower-realm pretas burning with craving, bound for hell arise, spontaneously (*vinipātikesu nijjhāma, taṇhika, petā nerayikā viya opapātikā yeva*) [cf Miln 294, 16, 303, 11; SD 48.1 (1.1.2.5)], while the rest arise in any of the 4 ways, as are yakshas, and all quadrupeds, birds and “long” animals (snakes or reptiles). (MA 2:36).

¹³⁰ *Ye kho te, sāriputta, sattā aṇḍakosam abhinibbhijja jāyanti.*

33.2 And what, Sāriputta, is **the womb-born birth**?

There are, Sāriputta, these beings born by breaking out from the caul¹³¹—this is called the womb-born birth.

33.3 And what, Sāriputta, is **moisture-born birth**?

There are, Sāriputta, these beings born in a rotting fish, in a decomposing corpse, in decaying broth, in a cesspool, or in a sewer¹³²—this is called moisture-born birth.

33.4 And what, Sāriputta, is **spontaneous birth**?¹³³

There are gods,¹³⁴ hell-beings, certain human beings and some beings in the lower worlds¹³⁵—this, Sāriputta, is called spontaneous birth.

These, Sāriputta, are the 4 kinds of birth.

34 THE HELL REFRAIN. *Sāriputta, inasmuch as I know thus, see thus, if anyone were to say thus, 'The recluse Gotama has neither the superhuman state nor the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!*

The recluse Gotama teaches a Dharma following an inquiry based on his own wits, fabricated by reasoning'—

if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not give up such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

34.2 *Sāriputta, just as a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, would here and now attain final knowledge, even so, Sāriputta, I say that such is the result—*

that if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not relinquish such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

The 5 destinies and nirvana (in brief)

35 Sāriputta, there are these **5 destinies** (*gati*). What are the five?¹³⁶

- | | |
|--------------------------------|-------------------------|
| (1) Hell, | <i>niraya</i> |
| (2) the animal womb, | <i>tiracchāna, yoni</i> |
| (3) the realm of the departed, | <i>petti, visaya</i> |
| (4) humans and gods, and | <i>manussa</i> |
| (5) the gods. | <i>devā</i> |

36 (1) And, Sāriputta, I understand **hell**, and the path and way leading to hell.

And I also understand how one, who, with the body's breaking up, after death,

has entered this path, will reappear in a state of misery, a bad destination, a suffering state, in hell.

¹³¹ *Ye kho te, sāriputta, sattā vatthikosam abhinibbhijja jāyanti.*

¹³² *Ye kho te, sāriputta, sattā pūti, macche vā jāyanti pūti, kuṇape vā pūti, kummāse vā candani, kāye vā oḷigalle vā jāyanti.*

¹³³ “Spontaneous birth” (*opapātikā yoni*), “born without parents, parthenogenetic, agamogenetic”: the word *opapātika* (qv CPD) is a sec der from *upapāta*, “coming into existence, birth, reappearance, rebirth,” hyperpalism for *upapāda* (perhaps under the influence of *upapattika*; BHS *upapāda*, *upapāduka*, *aupapāduka* qv BHSD), vb n of *upapajjati* (CPD: *upapāta*). On the 3 meanings of *opapātika*, see SD 40a.1 (5.1.2.4). On the lateness of this classification, see SD 38.3 (5.1.1.4).

¹³⁴ The gods of the Pure Abodes (*suddh'āvāsa*), the five highest heavens of the form world (*rūpa, loka*) are all non-returners, living out their last birth to become arhats and attain nirvana. These worlds are Āviha (“non-declining”), Ātappa (“Unworried”), Sudassā (“Clearly Visible”), Sudassī (“Clear-visioned”) and Akaṇiṭṭhā (“Highest”) (D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46).

¹³⁵ *Devā nerayikā ekacce ca manussā ekacce ca vinipātikā.*

¹³⁶ As in (**Pañca**) **Gati S** (A 9.58), SD 2.20. Comy explains that “destiny” (*gati*) here is where one would go according to the good or bad karma that one has done (*ettha sukata, dukkata, kamma, vasena gantabbāti gatiyo*) (MA 2:36); cf Dh 17-18 (DhA 1:150; VA 1:136), Dh 420. Later Buddhism adds a sixth realm, the asuras (*asura*, anti-gods or titans embodying violence and appropriateness).

(2) And, Sāriputta, I understand **the animal womb**, and the path and way leading to the animal womb. And I also understand how one, who, with the body's breaking up, after death, has entered this path, will reappear in the animal womb.

(3) And, Sāriputta, I understand **the realm of the departed** [the pretas], and the path and way leading to the realm of the departed.

And I also understand how one, who, with the body's breaking up, after death, has entered this path, will reappear in the realm of the departed.

(4) And, Sāriputta, I understand **human beings**, and the path and way leading to the human world. And I also understand how one, who, with the body's breaking up, after death, has entered this path, will reappear among human beings.

(5) And, Sāriputta, I understand **the gods**, and the path and way leading to the world of the gods. And I also understand how one, who, with the body's breaking up, after death, has entered this path, will reappear in a state of joy, a happy destination, in heaven.

(6) And, Sāriputta, I understand **nirvana**, and the path and way leading to nirvana. [74] And I also understand how one who has entered this path will, by realizing it for himself with direct knowledge, here and now, attain and dwell, in the freedom of mind and freedom by wisdom that are influx-free, with the destruction of the mental influxes.

The 5 destinies and nirvana (in detail)

37 (1) THE HELLS. Here, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain¹³⁷ person's mind with (my own) mind, I understand him, thus:

‘This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body's breaking up, after death, *would* reappear in a state of misery, a bad destination, a suffering state, in **hell**.’

37.2 And then, later, with the divine eye, that is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that with the body's breaking up, after death, he *had* reappeared in a state of misery, a bad destination, a suffering state, in hell, experiencing entirely painful, racking, piercing feelings.¹³⁸

37.3 PARABLE OF THE FIERY COAL PIT. Suppose, Sāriputta, there were **a fiery coal pit** deeper than a man's height, full of glowing coals with neither flame nor smoke;¹³⁹

and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty,¹⁴⁰ came by a one-way path leading directly¹⁴¹ to that same fiery coal pit.

37.4 Then a man with good sight on seeing him would say: ‘*This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path*, will come to this same fiery coal pit’;

and then later on he sees that he has fallen into that fiery coal pit, experiencing entirely painful, racking, piercing feelings.¹⁴²

¹³⁷ “That,” *ekacce*, lit “a certain (person).” In view of the amplified tr here, “that” gives better sense here.

¹³⁸ “Experiencing extremely painful, racking, piercing feelings,” *ek’anta,dukkhā tippā kaṭukā vedanā vediyamānam*, ie unending, continuous pain and suffering (MA 2:37). Cf §§38-39 nn.

¹³⁹ Cf (**Gaḥa,pati**) **Potaliya S** (M 54), where the parable illustrates sensual pleasures (M 54,18/1:365) + SD 43.8 (3.1.2); **Putta,maṃsa S** (S 12.63) the parable illustrates mental volition as food (S 12.63,16/2:99) + SD 20.6 (2.3.3). **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22) alludes to this parable to illustrate sensual pleasures (M 22,3.5), parable (4), SD 3.13. See also D 3:283; S 4:188; A 4:234, 5:175; Sn 396; J 1:231, 2:313, 4:118; Vism 124

¹⁴⁰ As at **Cūḷa Assa,para S** (M 40,13/1:284), SD 41.8.

¹⁴¹ “By a one-way path leading directly,” *ekāyanena maggena*. See SD 13(3.2).

¹⁴² Glossing on “pit” (*kāsu*), Comy qu **Temīya J** (J 538), when the Bodhisattva, Temīya, the king of Kāśī's son, emerges from his deaf-mute state and for the first time speaks, addressing the charioteer who is digging a hole as Temīya's grave (J 6:12); and **Nimi J** (J 541), where the Bodhisattva, from his aerial chariot, driven by the god Matali, views the burning hell-pits where the bad are suffering (J 6:107) (MA 2:37).

37.5 So too, Sāriputta, *by fully grasping a certain person's mind with (my own) mind, I understand him thus:*

'This person, behaving thus, conducting himself thus, having taken such a path, after death, when the body has broken up, would reappear in a state of misery, a bad destination, a suffering state, in hell.'

37.6 And, then, later, with the divine eye, that is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that with the body's breaking up, after death, he had reappeared in a state of misery, a bad destination, a suffering state, in hell, experiencing entirely painful, racking, piercing feelings.

38 (2) THE ANIMAL WOMB. Here, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person's mind with (my own) mind, I understand him, thus:

*'This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body's breaking up, after death, would reappear in **the animal womb**.'*

38.2 And, then, later on, with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that with the body's breaking up, after death, he had reappeared in the animal womb, experiencing painful, racking, piercing feelings.¹⁴³

38.3 PARABLE OF THE CESSPOOL. Suppose, Sāriputta, there were **a cesspool** deeper than a man's height full of filth;

and then a man [75] scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a one-way path leading directly to that same cesspool.

38.4 Then a man with good sight on seeing him would say:

'This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, will come to this same cesspool';

and then later on he sees that he has fallen into that cesspool, experiencing painful, racking, piercing feelings.

38.5 So, too, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person's mind with (my own) mind, *I understand that person thus:* 'This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body's breaking up, after death, would reappear in the animal womb.

38.6 And, then, later, with the divine eye, that is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that with the body's breaking up, after death, he had reappeared in the animal womb, experiencing entirely painful, racking, piercing feelings.

39 (3) THE REALM OF THE DEPARTED. Here, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person's mind with (my own) mind, I understand him, thus:

*'This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body's breaking up, after death, would reappear in **the realm of the departed** [the pretas].'*

39.2 And, then, later on, with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that with the body's breaking up, after death, he had reappeared in the realm of the departed, experiencing much painful feeling.¹⁴⁴

39.3 PARABLE OF THE TREE ON UNEVEN GROUND. Suppose, Sāriputta, there were **a tree growing on uneven ground** with scanty foliage casting a dappled shade;

and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a one-way path leading directly to that same tree.

39.4 Then a man with good sight on seeing him would say: *'This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, will come to this same tree';*

and then later on he sees that he is sitting or lying in the shade of that tree, experiencing much painful feeling.

¹⁴³ "Experiencing painful, racking, piercing feelings" (*dukkhā tippā kaṭukā vedanā vediyamānam*), with *ek'anta* ("entirely") omitted, ie, the suffering here is not as bad as in the hells [§37n] & (2).

¹⁴⁴ "Experiencing much pain," *dukkha, bahulā vedanā vediyamānam*, signifying great suffering, but sometimes with just a little happiness (MA 2:38 f). Cf §36 n.

39.5 So too, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person's mind with (my own) mind, I *understand him thus*:

'This person, acting thus, conducting himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body's breaking up, after death, would reappear in the realm of the departed [the pretas].

39.6 And, then, later, with the divine eye, that is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that with the body's breaking up, after death, he had reappeared in the realm of the departed, experiencing much painful feeling.

40 (4) HUMANS. Here, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person's mind with (my own) mind, I understand him, thus:

'This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body's breaking up, after death, would reappear among human beings.'

40.1 And then later on, with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that with the body's breaking up, after death, he had reappeared among **human beings**, experiencing much pleasant feeling.

40.2 **PARABLE OF THE TREE ON EVEN GROUND.** Suppose, Sāriputta, there were **a tree growing on even ground with thick foliage casting a deep shade**; and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a one-way path leading directly to that same tree.

40.3 Then a man with good sight on seeing him would say: *'This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, will come to this same tree';*

and then later on he sees that he is sitting or lying in the shade of that tree, experiencing much pleasant feeling.

40.4 So too, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person's mind with (my own) mind, I *understand that person thus*: *'This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body's breaking up, after death, he had reappeared among human beings, experiencing much pleasant feeling. [76]*

41 (5) THE HEAVENLY WORLD. Here, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person's mind with (my own) mind, I understand that person thus:

*'This person having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body's breaking up, after death, would reappear in a happy destination, in **the heavenly world**.'*

41.2 And then, later on, with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that with the body's breaking up, after death, he had reappeared in a happy destination, in the heavenly world, experiencing entirely pleasant feelings.

41.3 **PARABLE OF THE MANSION'S UPPER CHAMBER.**¹⁴⁵ Suppose, Sāriputta, there were a mansion,¹⁴⁶ and therein is **an upper chamber [a belvedere]**, with walls plastered within and without, protected from the wind, with bolted doors¹⁴⁷ and shuttered windows,¹⁴⁸

¹⁴⁵ This is the "fuller mansion pericope." Recurs as the "fullest mansion pericope" (with additional para) at (**Hat-thaka**) **Āḷavaka S** (A 3.34,7/1:137), SD 4.8. The "brief mansion pericope" [§41.3] (omitting mention of "mansion," *pāsāda*) recurs in **Mahā Sakuljūdāyī S** (M 77,32.3), SD 49.5. See foll n.

¹⁴⁶ "A mansion ... an upper chamber etc ...," (sg) *pāsādo ... kūṭāgāraṃ ullittāvalittam nivātam phusit'aggaḷam pihita,vāta,pānāṃ*: *Kūṭāgāra* here refers to an upper chamber. Comy glosses it as a "long house" (*pāsāda*) an elongated mansion (MA 2:39 = VA 654; see V:H 2:16 n5; see AA 2:168). See also A 3.34/1:137; A 8.30,10/4:231); (pl) *kūṭ'āgārāṇi pi... ullittāvalittāni nivātāni phusit'aggaḷāni pihita,vāta.pānāni* (M 115,2/3:61; A 3.1/1:101); loc *kūṭ'āgāresu ... ullittāvalittesu nivātesu phusit'aggaḷesu pihita,vātapānesu* (M 77,9/2:8). On *ullittāvalitta* ("plastered within and without") in ref to a residence (*vihāra*), see V 3:156, 4:47; a hut (*kūṭi*), see V 3:149. Ways of adorning windows (*vāta,pānā*) are given at V 4:47; also V 2:148; on doors, see Cv 5.14.5 (V 2:121), 6.2.2 (V 2:148); V 4:47. Cf this description at **Bahu,dhātuka S** (M 115,2.2/3:61), SD 29.1a = (**Tika**) **Bhaya S** (A 3.1/1:101; where also see the parable of the burning gabled houses (*aggi,mukko* [vl ~*mutto*] *kūṭāgārāṇi pi dahati*).

41.4 and in it are a couch [divan]¹⁴⁹ spread¹⁵⁰ with long-furred rugs, embroidered white woollen sheets, choice rugs of kadalī deer hide, spreads with red canopies, and crimson cushions at both ends [crimson pillows and bolsters].¹⁵¹

41.5 and, then, a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, comes by a one-way path leading directly to that same mansion.

41.6 Then, a man with good sight on seeing him would say: ‘*This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, will come to this same mansion*’;

and later on he sees that he is sitting or lying in that upper chamber in that mansion, experiencing entirely pleasant feelings.

41.7 So too, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person’s mind with (my own) mind, *I understand him, thus*: ‘This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, with the body’s breaking up, after death, had reappeared in a happy destination, in the heavenly world, experiencing entirely pleasant feelings.

42 (6) DESTRUCTION OF THE MENTAL INFLUXES. Here, Sāriputta, by fully grasping a certain person’s mind with (my own) mind, I understand that person thus:

‘*This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, by realizing it for himself with direct knowledge, here and now would enter upon and dwell in the freedom of mind and freedom by wisdom that are influx-free, with the destruction of the mental influxes.*’

42.2 And, then, later on, I saw that by realizing it for himself with direct knowledge, he, here and now, *had* attained and dwelt in the freedom of mind and freedom by wisdom that are influx-free, with the destruction of the mental influxes, experiencing entirely pleasant feelings.¹⁵²

42.3 PARABLE OF THE CLEAR LOTUS POND.¹⁵³ Suppose, Sāriputta, there were a **lotus pond** with clean, agreeable, cool water, transparent, with smooth banks, delightful, and nearby a dense wood;

and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a one-way path leading directly to that same lotus pond.

42.4 Then a man with good sight on seeing him would say:

‘This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path,

¹⁴⁷ “With bolted doors,” *phassit’aggalaṃ* (M 3:61; A 1:101, 137). Broadly, *aggala* can mean (1) a bolt (for door or window); (2) a door-leaf or panel, ie, *kavāṭa*. The Comy lemma reads *phussit’aggalaṃ* (MA 2:39), which is preferable. Comy also explains that the door-leaves (*kavāṭa*) (by which the opening is closed) is shut tight against the door-posts (*dvāra,bāhāhi saddhim supihita,kavaṭaṃ*, id).

¹⁴⁸ As in (**Mahā,purisa,vitakka**) **Anuruddha S** (A 8.30/4:230 @ SD 19.4), the imagery forms two separate ones: the first (A 8.30.10) ends here, and the rest of the sentence forms the second imagery (A 8.30.11). See **Mahā Sīha,-nāda S** (M 12,41/1:76), SD 49.1 n.

¹⁴⁹ *Pallaṅka*, a word that can refer to a simple mat (for monastics) or an elaborate divan (as here): see V:H 3:271 n3 for details.

¹⁵⁰ A longer list of items similar or related to those that follow are given at D 1:7; A 1:181; Mv 5.10.4-7 (V1:192); Cv 6.8 (V 2:163).

¹⁵¹ *Ubhato,lohitaḥpadhāno*, alt tr “crimson rests at both ends (of the couch).” Here, *upadhāna* refers to a kind or rest, or cushion, pillow. Comy says they are for the head and the feet (MA 2:39). See **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1,15/1:7) & **Venāga S** (A 3.63,3.2/1:181), SD 21.1, for a more detailed list.

¹⁵² *Ekanta,sukhā vedanā vedayamānaṃ*. Comy: Even though the description here is the same as that of heavenly happiness, the meaning is different. For, the happiness of heaven is not really extremely pleasant because the fevers of lust, etc, are still present there. But the bliss of nirvana is entirely pleasant in every way through the subsiding of all fevers. (MA 2:40)

¹⁵³ This is a well known parable, used in different contexts, recurring with some variations in **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,42.3/1:76), SD 49.1; **Cūḷa Assa,pura S** (M 40,13/1:283), SD 41.8; **Aputtaka S 1** (S 3.19,5/1:90 + 6/1:91), SD 22.4; **Āghāta Paṭivīnaya S 2** (A 5.163,11/3:188 + 17/3:190), SD 39.6; **Kāraṇa,pālī S** (A 5.194,1.5(5)/3:238) @ SD 45.11.

will come to this same lotus pond’;
 and, then, later on he sees that he has plunged into the lotus pond, bathed, drunk,
 and relieved of all his distress, tiredness and fever,
 and has come out again and is sitting or [77] lying in the dense forest,
 experiencing entirely pleasant feelings.¹⁵⁴

42.5 So too, Sāriputta, *by fully grasping a certain person’s mind with (my own own) mind I understand, that person thus: ‘This person, having acted thus, having conducted himself thus, having taken such a path, by realizing it for himself with direct knowledge, here and now would enter upon and dwell in the freedom of mind and freedom by wisdom that are influx-free, with the destruction of the mental influxes.’*

42.6 And, then, later on I saw that *by realizing it for himself with direct knowledge, he here and now had entered upon and dwelt in the freedom of mind and freedom by wisdom that are influx-free, with the destruction of the mental influxes, experiencing entirely pleasant feelings.*

These, Sāriputta, are the 5 destinies.

43 THE HELL REFRAIN. *Sāriputta, inasmuch as I know thus, see thus, if anyone were to say thus, ‘The recluse Gotama has neither the superhuman state nor the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!*

The recluse Gotama teaches a Dharma following an inquiry based on his own wits, fabricated by reasoning’—

if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not give up such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

43.2 *Sāriputta, just as a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, would here and now attain final knowledge,*

even so, Sāriputta, I say that such is the result—

that if he does not abandon such speech, if he does not abandon such a mind, if he does not relinquish such a view, he will, as it were, be carried away and cast into hell.

The Bodhisattva’s fourfold austerities

44 “Sāriputta, I recall having lived the holy life¹⁵⁵ comprising 4 factors.¹⁵⁶

- | | | |
|---|------------------------------------|-------|
| (1) I have been an <u>ascetic</u> (<i>tapassī</i>), | a supreme ascetic; | [§45] |
| (2) I have been <u>coarse</u> (<i>lūkha</i>), | supremely coarse; | [§46] |
| (3) I have been <u>scrupulous</u> (<i>jegucchī</i>), ¹⁵⁷ | supremely scrupulous; | [§47] |
| (4) I have been <u>secluded</u> (<i>pavivitta</i>), | supremely secluded. ¹⁵⁸ | [§48] |

¹⁵⁴ Comy gives these correlations: The lotus lake = noble path; the path to the lotus lake = one’s previous practice (*pubba, bhāga, paṭipadā*); the one on the path = the practitioner; the person who sees is like the Blessed One whose eye is open; the forest is like nirvana (MA 2:40).

¹⁵⁵ Comy speaks of 12 kinds of “holy life” (*brahma, cariya*) to contextualize this practice [4].

¹⁵⁶ “The holy life comprising 4 factors,” *catur-aṅga, samannāgataṃ brahma, cariyam*, ie, the supreme religious life of total asceticism, which is detailed here [§§44-48].

¹⁵⁷ *Jegucchī*, glossed as “detester of bad” (*pāpa, jegucchako*, MA 2:43). Cousins: The meaning must be “one who seeks or desires to guard (living beings from harm),” ie, desiderative n from √GUP, to protect. Here and below (*jeg-ucchismim*), it refers to a person behaving in a particular way rather than to a practice. See [6].

¹⁵⁸ Comy explains that the Buddha gives this account of his past ascetic practices because Sunakkhatta was a great admirer of extreme asceticism (as is clear from Pāṭika S, D 24, 1.7/3:6 f) and the Buddha wants to show he has no equal in the practice of austerities. §§44-56 apparently describe the Bodhisattva’s practices during the 6 years of austerities in his last existence, while §§57-61 recount his previous existences as a seeker of awakening.

45 MEDIUM SELF-MORTIFICATION PERICOPE¹⁵⁹(1) Sāriputta, such was my **asceticism** here:45.2 I was a **naked ascetic**,¹⁶⁰of loose habits [flouting conventions],¹⁶¹ licking his hands;¹⁶²

not coming when invited, not stopping when invited.

I did not accept food brought (to me) nor food specially prepared nor a meal invitation.

accepting nothing from a pot, from a bowl,

from across a threshold, among the firewood, from among the rice-pounders,

from two eating together, from a pregnant woman,¹⁶³ from a woman giving suck,from a woman gone to a man,¹⁶⁴ from a food-distribution centre,

from where a dog is waiting, from where flies are swarming,

accepting neither fish nor meat, drinking no wine nor beer nor cereal brew.¹⁶⁵I kept myself to one house, to one morsel [when collecting alms]. I kept myself to two houses, [78] to two morsels.¹⁶⁶ I kept to seven houses, to seven morsels.I lived on one small serving (of food) a day; on two small servings a day ... on seven small servings a day.¹⁶⁷

I took food once a day; once every two days ... once every seven days. Thus even up to a fortnight, I dwelt pursuing the practice of taking of food at such regular intervals.

¹⁵⁹ This medium self-mortification pericope [§§8.2-5] is mutatis mutandis at **Kassapa Sīha,nāda S** (D 8,14/1:165-167, SD 77.1 = **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25,8.2/3:41), SD 1.4, both of which have an “extended” set of 6 observances, not found in the otherwise identical medium pericope, found mutatis mutandis in **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,45/1:77 f), SD 49.1 = **Kandaraka S** (M 51,8/1:342 f), SD 32.9 = **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60,36/1:412), SD 35.5, with 6 additional observances = **Ghoṭa,mukha S** (M 94,10/2:161), SD 77.2 = **Acelaka Paṭipadā S I** (A 3.151/-1:295), SD 78.13 = **Atta,daṇḍa Sutta Nd** (Nm 15/416 f).

¹⁶⁰ “Naked ascetic” (*acelaka*), *a-celaka* = *acela*, “unclothed”: (m) V 4:92,14; J 5:18,25; M 1:281,33, DhA 1:309,-3, 400,13, 4:489,17; J 3:246.18, 6:229,7; (adj) M 1:307,23 = 342,25 = 412,4 = 2:161,26 = D 1:166,2 = 3:40,27 = A 1:295,8 = 2:206,7; (pl) M 1:238,15 (cf A 3:384,5); (titles) ~*vagga* A 1:295-299 @ SD 72.4, V 4:91-108, 5:19-21, 39 f; ~*laddhi* J 3:246,19, 39 f; ~*sāvaka* (m pl) A 3:384,2; ~*sikkhāpada* = Pāc 41 (V 4:91 f).

¹⁶¹ *Mutt’ācāro*.

¹⁶² *Haṭṭhāpalekhano*. Cf Sekh 52 (V 4:98) which proscribes hand-licking; D 1:166, 3:40; M 1:77, 238, 307; A 1:295; Pug 55.

¹⁶³ “From a pregnant woman ... gone to a man” (*gabbhinī pāyamanā puris’antara,gatā*), which is stock (M 1:77 = A 1:295; M 1:238, 307, 342 = 2:162 = Pug 55; A 2:206). On the last, see foll n.

¹⁶⁴ “A woman gone to a man,” *puris’antara,gata*, ie a woman having sex with a man. Comys gloss ~ as *rati anta-rāyo hotī ti na gaṇḥati*, “so that he does not face danger on account of lust” (DA 2:355; AM 2:44; AA 2:384; NmA 2:430; PugA 231), ie in interrupting the act; cf *pumaṃ gata*, “gone to a man” (J 5:154). This is contextual: for, Old Comy glosses more generally it as “married” (*gihi,gata*, “gone to a householder,” V 4:322,10), and other Comys, simply as a “adult woman” (*itthi*) (DA 1:79 = *itthi*, “woman,” as opp *kumārikā*, “girl”; MA 2:209).

¹⁶⁵ *Na suraṃ, na merayaṃ, na thus’odakaṃ pivati*. “Rice-wine,” *thus’odaka* (Skt *tuṣodaka*, “rice chaff”) “sour rice- or barley-gruel” (SED, sv *tuṣāmbu*). Comys: “a drink called Sovīraka made from (the husk of) all kinds of grain” (*sabba,sassa,sambhārehi kataṃ sovīrakaṃ*, DA 2:355 = NmA 431 = PugA 232; *sabba,sassa,sambhārehi kataṃ loṇa,sovīrakaṃ*, MA 2:44); *sabba,sassa,sambhārehi kata,sovīrakaṃ*, AA 2:385: all add that *thusodaka* is a strong drink and as such blamable (*ettha ca surā,pānam eva sāvajjaṃ*). On “salted Sovīraka (sour gruel)” (*loṇa,sovī-raka*); see Vinaya, where it is mentioned as a cure for stomach wind, and allowed as a beverage if mixed with water (Mv 6.16.3/V 1:210); mentioned in a list of drinks given to monks (Vv 177/2.2.6/23). **Suśruta Saṃhita** describes preparation of *tuṣodaka* as a medicine (SuśSaṃ 44, 40cd-44ab). It is said to be sour gruel prepared with unhusked cereals; in SuśSaṃ it refers to “fermented liquors of barley with husks” used as a purgative (G J Meulenbeld (tr), *Mādhvanidāna*, Leiden, 1974:408 f). When boiled with pulse and barley, it becomes an acetous fermentation called *tuṣāmbu*. D:RD 3:38, “gruel”; M:ÑB 1:104 “rice gruel.” See D:RD 1:229 n2, D:W n196. My tr is contextual which suggests some kind of fermented drink.

¹⁶⁶ This *peyyāla* is textual.

¹⁶⁷ “Small serving,” *datti*. Comy says that a *datti* is a small bowlful from which they leave out the main food (MA 2:45).

45.3 ¹⁶⁸I was an eater of greens [a vegetarian] or millet or wild rice or hide-parings or water-lettuce [moss]¹⁶⁹ or rice-bran or rice-remnants¹⁷⁰ or sesamum flour or grass or cow-dung,

I lived on forest roots and fruits; on fallen fruits.

I clothed myself in hemp; in hemp-mixed cloth; in shrouds;¹⁷¹ in refuse rags; in *tirīṭa*-tree¹⁷² bark; in antelope hide; in strips of antelope hide; in kusa-grass fabric; in bark fabric; in wood-shaving fabric; in human-hair cloak; in a bristle-cloak;¹⁷³ in owl's wings.

45.4 I pulled out (my) hair and beard, and was devoted to this practice.

I stood continuously, rejecting seats.

I squatted continuously, and was devoted to such a posture.

I used a bed of spikes, making it my bed.

45.6 I dwell devoted to (the ritual of) bathing in water thrice a day, the third one in the evening.¹⁷⁴

45.7 Thus, in these various ways I dwelt keeping to the practice of tormenting myself and mortifying the body. Such was my asceticism.¹⁷⁵

46 (2) Sāriputta, such was my **coarseness**: just as dust and dirt accumulate on the trunk of a *tindukā* tree,¹⁷⁶ over the years, so that they fell in flakes, so too, dust and dirt, accumulated over the years, fell off my body in flakes.

It never occurred to me, 'Now, let me rub this dust and dirt off with my hand, or let another rub this dust and dirt off with his hand'—it never occurred to me thus.

Such was my coarseness.

47 (3) Sāriputta, such was my **scrupulousness**: I was always mindful in stepping forwards and stepping backwards. I was full of pity (*dayā*) even for (the beings in) a drop of water, thus: 'Let me not, by a false step,¹⁷⁷ bring harm to the tiny creatures!'¹⁷⁸

¹⁶⁸ These 6 lines, up to "owl's wings" [§45.3] are spoken of as forms of "solitude" of outside sectarian wanderers: **Paviveka S** (A 3.92, 1.3-4), SD 44.2.

¹⁶⁹ "Water-lettuce," *haṭṭa*, a kind of water-plant, *Pistia stratiotes* (PED) of the Arales order.

¹⁷⁰ "Rice-remnants," *ācāma*, "the moisture of boiled rice, rice-scum, rice-water (without condiments, a mean unsavoury food—hence, prob interpreted as the burnt crust sticking to the pot)" (CPD): DA 356,15 = MA 2:45,12 = AA 2:355,17 = PugA 232,25; ie "burnt rice remnants in a pot," or "kerak nasi" in Malay.

¹⁷¹ Prob shrouds collected from corpses in a charnel ground. *Chava, dussa*, cloth of coverlet woven from cat-tail grass (cf CPD), Comy here says that it refers to discarded cloth made of *eraka*, taken from corpses and made into garments (*Chava, dussānīti mata, sarīrato chaddita, vatthāni, eraka, tiṇ'ādīni vā ganthetvā kata, nivāsānāni*, AA 2:354). **Eraka** (Skt; Marathi) is *Typha* grass (PED; CPD), prob *Typha elephantina*, also called bulrush, cat-tail grass, or Indian reed mace, one of the most universal of perennial grasses, which grows in wetlands and watersides. In ancient India, it was often woven together as rough clothing or mats. See J A Parrotta, *Healing Plants of Peninsular India*, NY: CABI Publishing, 2001; Malten 2003, See Daniel F Austin, "Sacred connections with cat-tail," *Ethnobotany Journal* 5, 2007:273-303: <http://www.ethnobotanyjournal.org/vol5/i1547-3465-05-273.pdf>

¹⁷² *Tirīṭa* (ts; BHS *tirīṭi*), which PED & BHSD identify as *Symplocos racemosa* (V 1:306 ~ka; D 1:166 = A 1:295; M 1:343; Pug 51). Its Indian names are the lodh tree, lodhra, tilva, or shavara; also śrimala ("propitious") or tilak (because it is used to make the *tilaka* or forehead mark). Its bark has medicinal usages. *Iranian Journal of Pharmaceutical Research*, Supplement 2 2004:44.

¹⁷³ *Vāla* specifically refers to the horse's tail or the hair at the end of the tail. Here, it refers to any kind of animal hair.

¹⁷⁴ Apparently to wash away his bad karma, ill fortune, or even "sins" (as we call them today). as related in (**Sud-dhika**) **Saṅgārava S** (S 7.2.11), SD 79.3.

¹⁷⁵ This passage [§45] is at **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60,36) = D 35,5, where this last sentence is replaced by "This is called the person who torments himself and is intent on tormenting himself." (M 60,36/1:412)

¹⁷⁶ Skt *tinduka*, *Diospyros embryopteris*, a tree of the ebony family.

¹⁷⁷ "by any false step" (*visama, gate*). I do not follow Comy which explains it as "May I not bring harm to the drops of water wherein tiny living beings live (*gate*) in low and high places, at the tip of grass-blades, tree-branches and so on" (MA 2:46). I think here the ascetic is very careful in his bodily actions so as not to cause any harm to tiny living creatures by not using water with living beings in them, not stepping on them, not breathing them in, etc. The particle *pi*, here rendered "even" is a key to the sense of the whole sentence.

Such was my scrupulousness.

48 (4) Sāriputta, such was my **seclusion**: [79] I would plunge into some forest dwelling, and when I saw a cowherd or a shepherd or someone gathering grass or someone gathering sticks or someone gathering forest products as food,¹⁷⁹ I would flee from grove to grove, from thicket to thicket, from valley to valley, from hill to hill.

Why was that? I thought: ‘Let them not see me and let me not see them!’ Just as a wild deer, on seeing human beings, flees from grove to grove, from thicket to thicket, from valley to valley, from hill to hill,

so too, on seeing a cowherd or a shepherd, or someone gathering grass or someone gathering sticks or someone gathering forest products as food, I would flee from grove to grove, from thicket to thicket, from valley to valley, from hill to hill.

Such was my seclusion.

Meal of the great filth

49 Sāriputta, I would go on all fours into the cow-pens¹⁸⁰ when the cattle had gone out and the cowherd had left them, and I would feed on the dung of the young suckling calves. As long as my own excrement and urine lasted, I fed on even my own excrement and urine.¹⁸¹

Such, Sāriputta, was my **meal of the great filth** (*mahā,vikaṭa,bhojana*).¹⁸²

Abiding in equanimity

50 Sāriputta, I would plunge into some fearful dense forest and dwell there—a dense forest so fearful that it would make most people’s hair stand up if he were not free from lust.¹⁸³

50.2 Sāriputta, during those cold wintry nights between the eighth days,¹⁸⁴ I would dwell by night in the open and by day in the dense forest. In the last month of the hot season I would dwell by day in the

¹⁷⁸ Bodhi: “The idea seems to be that his pity was directed, not towards microbes in a drop of water ... but towards the creatures that might be hurt or killed by carelessly discarded water.” (M:NB 1199 n193) This practice is clearly that of a Jain; cf **Kassapa Sīhanāda S** (D 8) and **Udumbārika Sīhanāda S** (D 25) where “not drinking cold water” is regarded as an ascetic practice (D 8,14/1:167, 25,8/3:42); see also D:W n200.

¹⁷⁹ *Vana,kammika*. M:NB renders it as “woodsman.” Here I follow Comy: “one who wanders in the forest seeking (edible) tubers, roots etc.” (MA 2:46)

¹⁸⁰ On ox-asceticism, see **Kukkura,vatika S** (M 57,2-6).

¹⁸¹ *Yāva kīvaṇ ca me sārīputta sakam mutta,karīsam apariyādiṇṇam hoti, sakam yeva sudam mutta,karīsam āhāremi*. The practice of the “filth eater” (*vekaṭika*) is also mentioned in **Kassapa Sīha,nāda S** (D 8,14/1:167). The Vinaya mentions the 4 “**great filth**” (*mahā,vikaṭā*), viz, (cow) dung (*gūtha*), (cow) urine (*mutta*), ash (*chārikā*) and clay (*mattikā*), as antidote for snakebite (V 1:206). Since they do not count as “nutriment,” a monk could, if there were no lay people around, use them directly (without being made “allowable,” *kappiya*, ie without being “offered”) (V 4:90). Cf “all kinds of filth” (*vekaṭika,vekaṭika*), said to be consumed by other sectarians (Miln 259). See also SD 49.2(1.3.4) (3) n.

¹⁸² *Idam su me sārīputta mahā,vikaṭa,bhojanasmim hoti*. Comy glosses **mahā,vikaṭa,bhojana** as “greatly filthy food” food” (*apakati,bhojana*) (MA 2:47). Neither *mahā,vikati* or *~vikaṭi* is found in PED. CPD explains *a-pakati-bhojana* as “abnormal, unnatural food.”

¹⁸³ See **Bhaya,bherava S** (M 4,19/1:20).

¹⁸⁴ “Between the eighth days” (*antar’atṭhaka*) (V 1:31, 288; M 1:79; A 1:36; U 6/1:9; Miln 396) is a regular cold spell in South Asia between the months of Māgha and Phagguna (AA 2:225). Comys say that these are the last 4 days of the month of Māgha and the first 4 days of the month of Phagguna, btw them totalling 8 nights (*māgha,-māsassa avasāne catasso, phaggunassa,māsassa ādimhi catassōti evam ubhinnaṃ antare atṭha rattī*, MA 2:48,10 ad M 1:79); similarly at VA 1128 :: V 1:31; AA 2:225 :: A 1:136 & UA 74 :: U 6,18. See V:B 4:41 n3 & UA:M 1:235 n1152). This is in late Feb and early Mar (or late December and early January, according to M:NB 1199 n194). See V:H 4:41 n3.

open and by night in the dense forest.¹⁸⁵ And there came to me spontaneously this stanza never heard before:

50.3 <i>Sotatto sosinno c'eva eko bhimsanake vane naggo na c'aggim-āsīno esanā,pasuto munīti</i>	Now chilled, now scorched, alone in a fearful forest, naked, without a fire to sit by, the (silent) sage is intent upon his quest. ¹⁸⁶
--	--

51 Sāriputta, I would make a charnel ground my bed, resting on the bones of the dead.¹⁸⁷ And cow-herd boys¹⁸⁸ came up and spat on me, urinated on me, threw dirt at me, and poked sticks into my ears. Yet, Sāriputta, I do not recall that I ever aroused a bad mind (of hate) against them. Such was my **abiding in equanimity**.¹⁸⁹ [80]

Purification through food

52 (1) THE KOLA CYCLE

52.1 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Purification arises through food.’¹⁹⁰

They said: ‘Let us live on **jujube fruit (kola)**,¹⁹¹ and they ate jujube fruit, ate jujube-fruit powder, drank jujube-fruit water, and made many kinds of jujube-fruit concoctions.’¹⁹²

52.2 Now I, Sāriputta, recall having eaten a single jujube fruit a day.

Sāriputta, you may think that the jujube fruit was bigger then, but you should not think so—the jujube fruit was then just the same size as it is now. Sāriputta, through feeding on a single jujube fruit a day, my body became entirely emaciated.

52.3 ¹⁹³Because of eating so little,

my limbs became like the joints of vine stems or bamboo stems;
my backside became like a buffalo’s (camel’s) hoof;¹⁹⁴
the projections of my spine stood out like corded beads;
my ribs jutted out like the crazy¹⁹⁵ rafters of an old broken shed;
the gleam of my eyes sank deep down into their sockets,
looking like the gleam of water gone far down in a deep well;

¹⁸⁵ Qu at Miln 396; cf J 1:390.

¹⁸⁶ This section and verse have been adopted by **Loma,haṁsa J** (J 94/1:390) [1.3.4], with more detailed Comy than at MA 2:48.

¹⁸⁷ See C 3.15.1; J 1:47; BA 61; ApA 51. CA 269 “making a bone my pillow.” This verse illustrates the highest perfection of equanimity of the Bodhisattva. See also I B Horner, *Ten Jataka Stories*, 1957: xxi.

¹⁸⁸ *Go,maṇḍala*. Comy: “cowherd’s boys” (*gopāla,dārakā*) (MA 2:48 f). Cf *gāmaṇḍala* at **Assalāyana S** (M 93,-18.7/2:155) n, SD 40a.2.

¹⁸⁹ This point and this section [§51] are recounted in verse as **Mahā Loma,haṁsa C** (C 3.15) [1.3.3].

¹⁹⁰ The view is that beings are purified by special diets and reduction, even deprivation, of food intake.

¹⁹¹ Jujube (*kola*) (M 1:80; A 3:49), Botanical name, *Ziziphus mauritania*. The fruit is a soft, juicy drupe, 2.5 cm in diameter (may be larger when well cultivated). Its shape may be oval, obovate, round or oblong; the skin smooth or rough, glossy, thin but tough. They ripen at different times even on a single tree; first green, turning yellow as they ripen. The fully mature fruit, the size of a cherry, is entirely red, soft, juicy, with wrinkled skin with a pleasant aroma.

¹⁹² As salads, cakes, balls (MA 2:49).

¹⁹³ This is the “emaciated Bodhisattva pericope” [§§52.3-6+53.3-6+54.3-6+55.3-6], ie, in 4 cycles—the kola cycle (§52), the bean cycle (§53), the sesame cycle (§54), and the rice cycle (§54). Only the pericope itself recurs in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36,281:245 f), SD 49.4. The cycles can be called “the emaciated Bodhisattva’s kola cycle pericope,” and so on.

¹⁹⁴ *Oṭṭha,padam*, often tr as “camel’s hoof,” but as noted by LS Cousins, it is prob “buffalo” in Vedic rather than “camel” in Classical Skt (1997: 268 f); see CPD: ²*oṭṭha*.

¹⁹⁵ *Jarā,sālāya gopanasīyo olugga,viluggā bhavanti*. Here, *olugga,vilugga* means “collapsing and fallen down, broken-down, dilapidated” (not “crazy” as in M:H & M:ÑB); see CPD: & DP: *olujjati*. See L S Cousins 1997: 269.

my scalp shrivelled and withered
like green bitter gourd shrivels and withers in the wind and sun.

52.4 When, Sāriputta, I thought: ‘I will touch the skin of my belly,’
it was my backbone that I took hold of.

When I thought: ‘I will touch my backbone,’ it was the skin of my belly that I took hold of.
Because I ate so little, the skin of my belly, Sāriputta, came to be cleaving to my backbone.

52.5 When, Sāriputta, I defecated or urinated, I fell over on my face right there.

52.6 When, Sāriputta, I tried to ease my body by rubbing my limbs with my hands,
the hair, rotted at their roots, fell off from my body as I rubbed—*all because of eating so little*.¹⁹⁶

53 (2) THE BEAN CYCLE

53.1 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Purification arises through food.’

They said: ‘Let us live on **bean (*mugga*)**,’ and they ate *bean*, ate *bean* powder, drank *bean* water, and made many kinds of *bean* concoctions.¹⁹⁷

53.2 Now I, Sāriputta, recall having eaten a single *bean* a day.

Sāriputta, you may think that the *bean* (seed) was bigger then, but you should not think so—the *bean* was then just the same size as it is now. Sāriputta, through feeding on a single bean a day, my body became entirely emaciated.

53.3 ¹⁹⁸*Because of eating so little,*
my limbs became like the joints of vine stems or bamboo stems;
my backside became like a buffalo’s (camel’s) hoof;
the projections of my spine stood out like corded beads;
my ribs jutted out like the crazy rafters of an old broken shed;
the gleam of my eyes sank deep down into their sockets,
looking like the gleam of water gone far down in a deep well;
my scalp shrivelled and withered
like green bitter gourd shrivels and withers in the wind and sun.

53.4 When, Sāriputta, I thought: ‘I will touch the skin of my belly,’
it was my backbone that I took hold of.

When I thought: ‘I will touch my backbone,’ it was the skin of my belly that I took hold of.
Because I ate so little, the skin of my belly, Sāriputta, came to be cleaving to my backbone.

53.5 When, Sāriputta, I defecated or urinated, I fell over on my face right there.

53.6 When, Sāriputta, I tried to ease my body by rubbing my limbs with my hands,
the hair, rotted at their roots, fell off from my body as I rubbed—*all because of eating so little*.¹⁹⁹

54 (3) THE SESAME CYCLE

54.1 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Purification arises through food.’

They said: ‘Let us live on **sesame (*tila*)**,’ and they ate *sesame* (seed), ate *sesame* powder, drank *sesame* water, and made many kinds of *sesame* concoctions.²⁰⁰

54.2 Now I, Sāriputta, recall having eaten a single *sesame* a day.

Sāriputta, you may think that the *sesame* (seed) was bigger then, but you should not think so—the *sesame* was then just the same size as it is now. Sāriputta, through feeding on a single *sesame* a day, my body became entirely emaciated.

54.3 ²⁰¹*Because of eating so little,*

¹⁹⁶ On this extreme self-mortification of the Bodhisattva, see **Mahā Saccaka** (M 36,28) n, SD 1.12.

¹⁹⁷ As salads, cakes, balls (MA 2:49).

¹⁹⁸ This whole section [§53.3-6] as in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36,281:245 f), SD 1.12 (abr) or SD 49.4 (full). The same passage recurs mutatis mutandis at §52.3-6 (where see nn) + §54,2-6.

¹⁹⁹ On this extreme self-mortification of the Bodhisattva, see **Mahā Saccaka** (M 36,28) n, SD 1.12.

²⁰⁰ As salads, cakes, balls (MA 2:49).

*my limbs became like the joints of vine stems or bamboo stems;
 my backside became like a buffalo's (camel's) hoof;
 the projections of my spine stood out like corded beads;
 my ribs jutted out like the crazy rafters of an old broken shed;
 the gleam of my eyes sank deep down into their sockets,
 looking like the gleam of water gone far down in a deep well;
 my scalp shrivelled and withered
 like green bitter gourd shrivels and withers in the wind and sun.*

54.4 When, Sāriputta, I thought: 'I will touch the skin of my belly,'
 it was my backbone that I took hold of.

When I thought: 'I will touch my backbone,' it was the skin of my belly that I took hold of.
 Because I ate so little, the skin of my belly, Sāriputta, came to be cleaving to my backbone.

54.5 When, Sāriputta, I defecated or urinated, I fell over on my face right there.

54.6 When, Sāriputta, I tried to ease my body by rubbing my limbs with my hands,
 the hair, rotted at their roots, fell off from my body as I rubbed—all because of eating so little.²⁰²

55 (1) THE RICE CYCLE

55.1 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: 'Purification arises through food.'

They said: 'Let us live on **rice** (*taṇḍula*),' and they ate *rice*, ate *rice* powder, [81] drank *rice* water, and made many kinds of *rice* concoctions.²⁰³

55.2 Now I, Sāriputta, recall having eaten a single *rice* (grain) a day.

Sāriputta, you may think that the *rice* (grain) was bigger then, but you should not think so—the *rice* was then just the same size as it is now. Sāriputta, through feeding on a single *rice* a day, my body became entirely emaciated.

55.3 ²⁰⁴Because of eating so little,

*my limbs became like the joints of vine stems or bamboo stems;
 my backside became like a buffalo's (camel's) hoof;
 the projections of my spine stood out like corded beads;
 my ribs jutted out like the crazy rafters of an old broken shed;
 the gleam of my eyes sank deep down into their sockets,
 looking like the gleam of water gone far down in a deep well;
 my scalp shrivelled and withered
 like green bitter gourd shrivels and withers in the wind and sun.*

55.4 When, Sāriputta, I thought: 'I will touch the skin of my belly,'
 it was my backbone that I took hold of.

When I thought: 'I will touch my backbone,' it was the skin of my belly that I took hold of.
 Because I ate so little, the skin of my belly, Sāriputta, came to be cleaving to my backbone.

55.5 When, Sāriputta, I defecated or urinated, I fell over on my face right there.

55.6 When, Sāriputta, I tried to ease my body by rubbing my limbs with my hands,
 the hair, rotted at their roots, fell off from my body as I rubbed—all because of eating so little.²⁰⁵

56 Yet, Sāriputta, by such postures, by such practice, by such austerities, I did not gain any super-human state, any distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.

²⁰¹ This whole section [§53.3-6] as in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36,281:245 f), SD 1.12 (abr) or SD 49.4 (full). The same passage recurs mutatis mutandis at §52.3-6 (where see nn) + §54,2-6.

²⁰² On this extreme self-mortification of the Bodhisattva, see **Mahā Saccaka** (M 36,28) n, SD 1.12.

²⁰³ As salads, cakes, balls (MA 2:49).

²⁰⁴ This whole section [§53.3-6] as in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36,281:245 f), SD 1.12 (abr) or SD 49.4 (full). The same passage recurs mutatis mutandis at §52.3-6 (where see nn) + §54,2-6.

²⁰⁵ On this extreme self-mortification of the Bodhisattva, see **Mahā Saccaka** (M 36,28) n, SD 1.12.

Why was that? Because I did not gain that noble wisdom which, when gained, is noble and emancipating and leads the one who lives in accordance with it to the complete destruction of suffering.

Purification through rebirth

57 There are, Sāriputta, certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Purification arises through **the cycle of rebirths** (*samsāra*).’²⁰⁶

But, Sāriputta, it is impossible to find a realm in samsara, in which I have not already **[82]** arisen in this long journey, except for the gods of the Pure Abodes.²⁰⁷

For, had I passed through the cycle as a god in the Pure Abodes, I would never have returned to this world.²⁰⁸

58 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Purification arises through (a particular) **rebirth** (*upapatti*).’

But it is impossible to find any particular kind of rebirth into which I have not already been reborn in this long journey, except for the gods of the Pure Abodes.

For, had I passed through the cycle as a god in the Pure Abodes, I would never have returned to this world.

59 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Purification arises through (some particular) **abode** (*āvāsa*).’

But it is impossible to find any kind of abode in which I have not already dwelt in this long journey, except for the gods of the Pure Abodes.

For, had I passed through the cycle as a god in the Pure Abodes, I would never have returned to this world.

Purification through rituals

60 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Purification arises through **sacrifice** (*yañña*).’

But it is impossible to find any kind of sacrifice which has not already been offered up by me in this long journey, when I was either a head-anointed noble king or a wealthy brahmin.

61 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this: ‘Purification arises through **fire-worship** (*aggi,paricariyā*).’

But it is impossible to find any kind of fire that has not already been worshipped by me in this long journey, when I was either a head-anointed noble king or a wealthy brahmin.

The Buddha’s mind

62 Sāriputta, there are certain recluses and brahmins whose doctrine and view is this:

‘As long as this good man is still young, a black-haired young man endowed with the blessing of youth, **in the prime of life**, so long is he possessed of the most lucid wisdom.

But when this good man is old, aged, burdened with years, advanced in life, and come to the last stage, being 80, 90 or 100 years old,²⁰⁹ then he loses that lucidity of his wisdom.’

62.2 But, Sāriputta, you should not think so. I am now old, aged, burdened with years, advanced in life, and come to the last stage—my years have turned 80.²¹⁰

²⁰⁶ Cf Makkhali Go,sāla’s fatalistic (a kind of indeterminist) view that we are “purified through transmigration” (*samsāra,suddhi*): see **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,19/1:53 f), SD 8.10. For the Buddha’s rejection of Makkhali’s fatalism, see (**Sotāpatti**) **Hetu S** (S 24.7), SD 23.6. On determinism and fatalism, see SD 7.7 (1.6).

²⁰⁷ Only non-returners are reborn in the Pure Abodes (*suddh’āvāsa*). Qu at DA 2:511.

²⁰⁸ Rebirth into the Pure Abodes (*suddh’āvāsa*) is possible only for non-returners.

²⁰⁹ Stock phrase, as at V 2:88, 3:2.

²¹⁰ Comy says that the Buddha gave this discourse during the year of his parinirvana (MA 2:51).

Now, Sāriputta, suppose that here I had four disciples,²¹¹ each with a hundred years' lifespan, perfect in mindfulness, in assimilative memory, in retentive memory and in lucidity of wisdom.²¹²

62.3 Sāriputta, suppose that a skilled archer, trained, tried and tested, could easily shoot a light arrow through²¹³ the shadow of a palm tree,²¹⁴

even so, to that extent they are perfect in mindfulness, assimilative memory, [83] retentive memory and lucidity of wisdom.

62.4 Suppose that they continuously asked me about the 4 focuses of mindfulness, and that I kept answering them when asked, and that they remembered each answer of mine, and neither asked a secondary question nor paused except to eat, drink, chew and taste,²¹⁵ to urinate and defecate, and to rest in order to dispel sleepiness and tiredness.

62.5 Still, Sāriputta, the Tathagata's exposition of the Dharma, his explanations of words and phrases of the Dharma,²¹⁶ and his replies to questions would not yet come to an end, before those four disciples of mine, each with a hundred years' lifespan, living out a hundred years, would have died at the end of those hundred years.

62.6 Sāriputta, even if you have to carry me about on a litter,²¹⁷ still there will be no change in the Tathagata's clarity of wisdom.²¹⁸

63 If, Sāriputta, it were to be rightly said of anyone:

'A being not subject to delusion has appeared in the world for the welfare and happiness of many, out of compassion for the world, for the good, welfare and happiness of gods and humans,' it is of me indeed it would be rightly spoken that

a being not subject to delusion has appeared in the world for the welfare and happiness of many, out of compassion for the world, for the good, welfare and happiness of gods and humans.

Nāga,samāla

64 Now at that time, the venerable Nāga,samāla was standing behind the Blessed One, fanning him.²¹⁹

Then, he said to the Blessed One,

"It is wonderful, bhante! It is marvellous, bhante! As I listened to this Dharma exposition, body-hairs stood on end. Bhante, what is the name of this Dharma exposition?"

²¹¹ This appears to be a synecdoche for the 4 kinds of disciples—monks, nuns, laymen and laywomen—who are streamwinners, once-returners, non-returners and arhats.

²¹² The Pālī for the 4 terms respectively are *sati*, *gati*, *dhiti*, *paññā,veyyattiya*. Comy explains *sati* as the ability to grasp in mind a hundred or a thousand phrases as they are being spoken; *gati*, the ability to bind them and retain them in the mind; *dhiti*, the ability to recite back what has been grasped and retained; and *paññā,veyyattiya*, the ability to discern the meaning and logic of those phrases. Ānanda is declared to be the foremost amongst monks with *sati*, *gati* and *dhiti* (A 1:24 f). The last quality—*paññā,veyyattiya*—is perhaps synonymous with *mahā,paññā*, in which Sāriputta is declared foremost (A 1:23).

²¹³ *Tiriyani*, usually tr as "across" (M:ÑB 177; A:H 4:288), but Bodhi has "shoot past" (S:B 157).

²¹⁴ As at S 1:62, 2:265 f; A 2:48, 4:429; J 4:211. AA says that the "shadow" is a span and 4 fingers (about 8 ins or 20 cm) wide and so would be passed quickly. See A:H 4:288 n3.

²¹⁵ *Asita,pīta,khāyita,sāyitā*. These are the 4 modes of consuming food, namely: *eat* food; *drink* liquids; *chew* solid food, a toothstick, betel-nut, chewing gum; *taste* (or lick) sweets, ice-cream.

²¹⁶ "Words and phrases of the Dharma," *dhamma,pada,vyañjana*.

²¹⁷ "Litter," *mañcaka*, lit "small bed" (from *mañca*, "bed").

²¹⁸ "Clarity of wisdom," *paññā,veyyattiyam*, alt tr "lucidity of wisdom"; as at **Cūḷa Hatthi,padōpama S** (M 27), where the brahmin Jāṇussoṇi questions the wanderer Pilotikā (who has great faith in the Buddha) what he thinks of the Buddha's "clarity of wisdom" (M 27,2.3/1:175), SD 40a.5.

²¹⁹ Nāga,samāla is the Buddha's personal attendant during the first 20 years of this ministry (MA 2:53). Here, however, the Buddha states that "my years have turned 80" [§62.2]. Perhaps, Nāga,samāla is merely performing a task of the moment, even though he is not the Buddha's personal attendant at this time.

64.2 “In that case, Nāga,samāla, remember this Dharma exposition as the ‘Hair-raising Exposition’
(*loma.hamsana,pariyāya*).”²²⁰

64.3 The Blessed One said this. The elder Nāga,samāla joyfully approved of the Blessed One’s word.

— evaṃ —

[For **Bibliography**, see end of SD 49]

040128 100327 101015 110710 131008 150922 160307

²²⁰ This is the name by which the Sutta is known at Miln 398 & Comy (KvuA 104). On the Loma,hamsana Pariyāya, see (1.3.2).